

GAEKWAD'S ORIENTAL SERIES

Published under the authority of
the Government of His Highness
the Maharaja Gaekwad of Baroda.

General Editor:
B. BHATTACHARYYA, M.A., Ph.D

NO. XXXIX

RIGS. PAR. HJUG. PAHI. SGO
NYĀYAPRAVEŚA

PART II

NYAYAPRAVESA
OF
ACARYA DINNAGA

PART II
TIBETAN TEXT

COMPARED WITH SANSKRIT AND CHINESE VERSIONS AND EDITED WITH AN
INTRODUCTION, COMPARATIVE NOTES AND INDICES

BY

VIDHUSHEKHARA BHATTACHARYYA
PRINCIPAL, VIDYABHAVANA, VISVABHARATI

1927

CENTRAL LIBRARY
BARODA

Printed by Manilal Itcharam Desai at the
GUJARATI NEWS PRINTING PRESS,
Bake House Lane, Fort, BOMBAY,
and published by Newton Mohun Dutt, Curator of Libraries,
on behalf of the Government of His Highness the Maharaja
Gaekwad of Baroda at the Central Library, Baroda.

Price Rs. 1-8-0.

À MON CHER AMI

Dr. SYLVAIN LÉVI,

PROFESSEUR AU COLLÈGE DE FRANCE,

QUL M'A ENSEIGNÉ

LE MANTRA

DES ÉTUDES TIBÉTAINES ET CHINOISES

À LA

VISVABHARATI, SANTINIKETAN,



སྒྲུབ་ དཔོན་ ཡུ་གཤམ་ སྒྱུ་གྲུབ་ རོ།

ABBREVIATIONS.

- A = The Xylograph in the Asiatic Society of Bengal.
- C = The Xylograph in the Calcutta University Library.
- Ch = The Chinese Version of the *Nyāyapraveśa*.
- MS = Manuscript, i. e. the transcriptions of T¹ and T², supplied by Mr. Johan Van Manen.
- NB = The *Nyāyabindu* of Bibliotheca Indica or Bibliotheca Buddhica edition, both Sanskrit and Tibetan Versions.
- NP = The *Nyāyapraveśa*.
- PNT = The *Pramāṇanayataṭṭvālokaśāhikāra*, Yaśovijaya-Granthāmālā, 22, Vira Era 2481.
- PS = The *Pramāṇasamuccaya* (Tibetan Version).
- Skt. = The Sanskrit Version of the *Nyāyapraveśa*, or Sanskrit in general.
- T¹ = The Tibetan Translation direct from Sanskrit.
- T² = The Tibetan Translation from Chinese which in its turn was made from Sanskrit.
- Tib. = Tibetan
- V = The Xylograph of *Nyāyapraveśa* in the Visvabharati Library.
-

CONTENTS.

	Page
PREFACE	ix
Introduction	xi-xxii
1. The Nyāyapraveśa	xi
2. The Author of the Nyāyapraveśa	xiii
3. The Translations of the Nyāyapraveśa	xviii
4. The Comparison of Different Versions	xix
5. Analysis of the Subject	xxiv
The Tibetan Text	1-10
Comparative Notes	11-29
Indexes	31-58
I. Index of Proper Names	33-34
A. Sanskrit-Tibetan	33
B. Tibetan-Sanskrit	34
II. Index of Verses	34
A. Sanskrit	34
B. Tibetan	34
III. Index of words and Phrases... ..	35-58
A. Sanskrit-Tibetan	35-45
B. Tibetan-Sanskrit	46-58
Appendix (The Chinese Words and Sentences in the Com-	
parative Notes)	59-64
Addenda et Corrigenda... ..	67

PREFACE.

Professor Sylvain Lévi will ever be remembered in the annals of the Visvabharati not only as its first Visting Professor, but also as one who first introduced here the Tibetan and Chinese studies. And when Principal A. B. Dhruva of the Benares Hindu University who himself had undertaken to edit the *Nyāyapraveśa* together with the *Vṛtti* and *Pañjikā* on the work by Haribhadra Sūri and Pārśvadeva Gaṇin respectively, requested me to read for him the Tibetan versions of the work, it was Professor Sylvain Lévi who induced me to undertake the task.

There are two Tibetan translations of the work, one direct from Sanskrit (T¹) and the other from a Chinese translation made from Sanskrit (T²). These are described in the Introduction which follows.

These two Tibetan translations are to be found in Tanjur, Mdo, Ce, fols. 180^b-184,^b and 184^b-189^a respectively. Principal Dhruva secured through Prof. Lévi from Mr. Johan Van Manen, the present Secretary to the Asiatic Society of Bengal, the transcriptions (MS), of the two Tibetan texts and kindly placed them at my disposal. In the transcriptions there are some corrections in red ink made after comparing them with the Xylograph belonging to that Society (A). I have also made use of the Xylographs of the Calcutta University (C) and the Visvabharati (V). All these Xylographs including that from which Mr. Johan Van Manen had those two transcriptions (T¹ and T²) prepared are of the Narthang edition.

Principal Dhruva sent me also a transcription of the original Sanskrit of the *Nyāyapraveśa* (Skt.).

The Tibetan text given here is of T¹.

In preparing the edition of T¹ I have compared it with the original Sanskrit and T². I have also made an attempt to compare it with the Chinese version made by Hsien-tsang (Ch), so far as my meagre knowledge of the language has permitted.

I wish I had fully made use of the *Vṛtti* and the *Pañjikā*, but unfortunately I had no access to them except a few pages of the former which are printed with the Sanskrit text.

The variations as found by the comparison of these three texts, Sanskrit, Tibetan, and Chinese, are embodied in the Comparative Notes (pp. 11-29) and are further discussed in the Introduction.

INTRODUCTION.

1. THE NYĀYAPRAVEŚA.

The present work is called *Nyāyapraveśa*. It has also been named *Nyāyapraveśaka*¹ or *Nyāyapraveśa* or *Nyāyapraveśaka-sūtra*². This name, *Nyāyapraveśa*, is supported also by such titles of works in Skt. as *Nyāyapraveśa-vṛtti*, a commentary on it by Haribhadra (about 1120 A. D.); *Nyāyapraveśa-pañjikā*, another commentary on the same work by Pārśvadeva (1133 A. D.); and *Nyāyapraveśa-tippaṇa*, a gloss by Śrīcandra on Haribhadra's *Nyāyapraveśa-vṛtti*. In the Tib. index to the Tanjur it is named *Nyāyapraveśa-śāstra* (Bstan. bcos. rigs. pa. la. hjug. pa); while in T¹ it is styled *Prāmāṇyāyapraveśadvāra* (Tshad. ma, rigs. par. hjug. pañ. sgo), p. 1; or simply *Nyāyapraveśadvāra* (Rigs. par. hjug. pañ. sgo), pp. 10, 28; and in T² *Framāṇaśāstra-nyāyapraveśa* (Tsad. mahi. bstan. bcos. rigs. pa. la. hjug. pa), p. 28. In Chinese it is *Yin mih yu cên li lun*, p. 28, meaning literally in Skt. *Hetuvidyāpraveśa-samyagyuktisāstra* which is in other words, *Nyāyapraveśa Tarkaśāstra*. T¹ observes in the colophon (p.p. 28-29) that in a Chinese book it is seen as *Nyāyapraveśa*, while in Tibet it is now known as *Nyāyadvāra* (Rgyaḥi dpe. la. rigs. pa. la. hjug. pa. shes. snañ diñ sañ. bod. rnams rigs pañ. sgo. shes. grags. so ||). That this observation of T² is quite right, so far as the Tib. version is concerned, is evident from the references to it in the *Viśālāmālavatī*, now extant only in Tibetan, a commentary on Dinnāga's PS, as we shall see presently in discussing the question of the authorship of NP. In that work, as well as in Dinnāga's own *vṛtti* on his PS it is always alluded to as *Nyāyapraveśa*. It goes without saying that in fact *Nyāyapraveśa* and *Nyāyadvāra* are one and the same. It may also be

1. Haribhadra's *Vṛtti*, p. 9 (Skt. text) "न्यायप्रवेशकस्याख्यम्," "न्यायप्रवेशकस्य चाख्यम्;" Pārśvadeva's *Pañjikā* "न्यायप्रवेशकमिति प्रथिते सुशास्त्रे प्रारम्भ्यते सद्यपि द्वापि द्वि पञ्चिकेयम्,"—quoted in the *History of India Logic* by Vidyābhūṣaṇa, p. 220.

2. As found in our Skt. text edited by Principal Dhruva. He informs me that the title is given in the oldest Ms. which contains both the text and the *vṛtti* of Haribhadra. One of the younger Mss. refers to all the quotations from the text as *sūtra*.

noted that in the title, *Nyāya-praveśa-dvāra*, one of the last two words is unnecessary.

In Chinese we have a work on logic called *yin min cān lǐ mān lun*, which literally in Skt. is *Hetuvidyāsamagryakṛtadvāraśāstra* or *Nyāyatarkadvāraśāstra* (Nanjio, Nos. 1223, 1224). This is generally known by the name, *Nyāyadvāratarkaśāstrā*. But, I think, the Chinese title should be translated by *Nyāyatarkadvāraśāstra*. For, why the word *dvāra* (*mān*) should be taken with *nyāya* (*yin min*) and not with *tarka* (*cān lǐ*) which just preceeds it? That this word must be *Nyāyatarkadvāra* is supported by the last five characters of the last *kārikā* (No. 28) of the book itself. Those characters are *miao i cān lǐ mān*, the Skt. equivalent of which is *sadārthātarkadvāra*. Clearly, we have here *tarkadvāra*. Sugiura (*Hindu Logic*, p. 74) has translated the *kārikā* rendering those five characters into English by "Gate of the supreme Nyāya" some what figuratively. Yet, he styles the work *Dāra-tarka-śāstra*.

Vidyābhūṣaṇa (*History of Indian Logic*, p. 289, note 1) says that the NP is probably the same as *Nyāyadvāratarkaśāstra* (= *Nyāyatarkadvāra*). That these two works are different was quite clear from Sugiura's *Hindu Logic* long before (1900) Vidyābhūṣaṇa's book (1921). The NP is now before us. It is in prose with only two verses, one at the beginning and the other at the end; while the *Nyāyatarkadvāra* is composed only of verses or *kārikās*, twenty eight in number, there being not a single line in prose.

Incidentally one thing may be briefly discussed here. Nanjio says in his Catalogue (p. 270, Nos. 1223, 1224) that the author of this work is Nāgārjuna. Takakusu follows it (*A Record of the Buddhist Religion* by I-tsing, 1896, pp. 177, 186). But in fact, it is not so. The real author of it is Dinnāga and not Nāgārjuna. Nanjio seems to have made a mistake in rendering the name into Skt. The name as given in Chinese in the book itself is *Yu lun* the Skt. equivalent of which is *Dinnāga* (See O. Rosenberg: *Introduction to the Study of Buddhism*, Part I, 1916, p. 99). It should, however, be noted that generally for the name of Dinnāga we have in Chinese *Luō shūn* (*op. cit.* p. 69). The above two Chinese characters cannot give the name, Nāgārjuna, for which we have the following: (1) *Luh shu*, lit. 'dragon-tree'; (2) *Luh shan*, lit. 'dragon-conqueror'; or (3) *Luh mah*, lit. 'dragon the brave' (Nanjio, *Catalogue*, p. 369). See JASB, 1905, p. 222.

2. THE AUTHOR OF THE NYĀYAPRAVEŚA.

That Diñnāga is the author of our NP can be proved on several grounds. In the Skt. text as we have it now there is nothing to show his authorship. But in its Tib versions it is clearly stated. T¹ says (§65; Note 139, p. 28) इति न्यायप्रवेशद्वारं मद्वाचार्थं दिङ्नामकृतिः सम्पूर्णा । (shes. pa rigs. par. hjug. pahi. sgo. slob. dpon. chen. po phyogs. kyi ghañ. pos. mdzad. pa. rdzogs. so); and so reads T²: प्रमाणशङ्खं न्यायप्रवेशो नाम मद्वाचार्थं दिङ्नामकृतिः सम्पूर्णा । (tshad. mahi bstan. bcos rigs. pa. la. hjug. pa. shes. bya. ba. slob dpon. chen. po. phyogs. kyi. glañ. pos. mdzad. pa. rdzogs. so ||).

The PS (Tsad. ma. kun. las. btus. pa) which is now extant only in Tib. (Mdo. Ce. XCV. 1) is a well-known work of Diñnāga. The beginning verse of it runs:

tshad. mar. gyur pa. hgro. la. phan. par. bshen |
ston. pa. bde. gregs. skyob. la. phyag. htshal. nas |
tshad. ma. sgrub. phyir. rañ. gi. gshuñ. kun. las |
btus. te. sna. tshogs. lthor. rnam. hdir. gcig. bya. ||

And the following is its Sanskrit:

प्रमाणभूताय जगद्धितेविने
प्रणम्य शङ्खे सुखाय वायिने ।
प्रमाणसिद्धये स्वनिबन्धहृन्दतः
हरिश्चन्द्रे विप्रसूतं समुचितम् ॥¹

Here in explaining the word स्वनिबन्धहृन्दतः (rañ. gi. gshuñ. kun. las) Diñnāga himself says in his own *words* on the PS:

1. The first two lines of this verse in Skt. are found in the *Abhidharma-koshaśāhyā* of Yaśomitra, Biblicotheca Buddhica, p. 7. The last two lines are conjecturally reconstructed by the present writer. In his commentary on PS, *Viśāṣmalavati* (Yañs. pa. dan. dri. ma. med. pa. dan. ldan. ma) Jinendrabuddhi or Jinendramati (Rgyal. bañ. dbañ. poñi blo. gros), but in no case Jinendrabodhi (as writes Vidyabhūṣaṇa in his *History of Indian Logic*, p. 328), for the Tib. words *blo. gros* mean *buddhi* or *mati* and not *bodhi* for which we have *byañ chub*) says in the course of commenting on the words *sna. tshogs. lthor. rnam.* in d "rab. tu. rtogs. ni. pra. sñ. taho | gañ. la. rab. tu. rtogs. pa. dan. bral. ba. de ni. vi. pra. sñ. taho ||" It may be translated thus: प्रकरणं दि प्रसूतम् । यद् प्रकरणविरहितं तद् विप्रसूतम् । As the Skt. word is transliterated here we are sure that it was actually used by Diñnāga for the Tib. words referred to above.

2. Mdo, Ce. fols. 13^b ff. (Nanhang ed.); Cordier III, p. 434.

de. lta. buhi. you. tan. can. gyi. ston. pa. la. phyag.
htshal. nas. tshad. ma. bsgrub. par. bya. bali. phyir. *rah. gi.*
rah. gi. byed. pa. rigs. pahi. sgo. la. sogs. pa. rnam. las.
hdi. gcig. tu. lta. te. tshad. ma. kun. las. lta. pa. btsam.
par. byaho. n

॥ इति गुणं आचारं प्रमाणं प्रमाणसिद्धिः स्वयं कथं न्यायं रा रा दिभ्य
(= स्वा प्र वे द्य दिभ्य) इति नोचितं प्रमाणं च मुच्यते आत्मनः ॥³

Thus it is perfectly clear from the above that the author of NP is Dinnāga.

Again, Jinendrabuddhi writes on the same passage in his *Vilāṣamalavāṭī* (Mdo. Re, fol. 4^b) referred to in a previous note:

gal. te. dehi. don. du. hdi. btsam. par. bya. ba. yin.
na. dehi tshe. btsam. mi. bya. ste. tshad. ma. grub. pa.
ni. rigs. pahi. sgo. la. sogs. pa. rah. gi. *gshun. gis. khyod.*
kyis. shar. kho. nar. bsgrubs. zin. pa. byed. kyi. phyir. ro ||
gan. bsgrubs. zin. pa. de. ni. sgrub. pahi. ched. du. rtogs.
pa. dan. ldan. pas. btsams. par. bya. ba. ana. yin. te.
bsgrubs. zin. pahi. zan. bshin. no || tshad. ma. sgrub. pa.
yan. bsgrubs. zin. no ||

॥ यदि तदर्थमात्रमव्यक्तता नान्वयः ॥ प्रमाणसिद्धिर्हि न्यायं रा रा दि (= न्याय प्र वे-
द्य दि) रा नि व न्ये न स्वया द्योतितत्वाद् । यद् द्विदं स्वयं सिद्धिनिमित्तं प्रसक्तता
नान्वयः कर्तव्यः । सिद्धाचवत् । समाकृषिद्वयं राधितम् ॥

The same author writes again in the same connection after a few lines:

rah. gi. gshun. rigs. pahi. sgo. la. sogs. pa. ni. tshad
ma. gtan. la. hbebs. pa. rah. tu. rtogs. pa. dan. bral. baho.
de. shar. yan. der. "mñon. sum. rtog. pa. dan. bral. ba," shes.
pa. mñon. sum. gyi. mtshan. ñid. hdi. la. dmigs bsal. byas.
pa. med. la. dehi. phyir. zla. ba. gñis. la. sogs. pahi. ces. pa.
yan. mñon. sum. ñid. du. thal. bar. hgyur ro. tgyas. pa.
dan. bral. ba. yan. de. ste. hdod. bsdu. paho ||

स्वविद्वयो न्यायं रा रा दिः (= न्याय प्र वे द्य दिः) प्रमाणनिर्णयप्रमाणरहितः ।
तथा हि । तत्र "प्रत्यक्षं कल्पनायोक्तमिति" प्रत्यक्षलक्षणम् (NP, Skt. p. 7, l. 13;
Tib. § 54) । अस्यालक्षणे न विकलम् । तस्माद् द्वित्यन्वयिज्ञानमपि प्रत्यक्षमेव
प्रमत्तमेव । किन्तु अस्मिन् णि तत्र संविज्ञानमिति ॥

3. We may read also निबद्धं for आत्मनः (Tib. *btsam. bya*).
4. The Xylograph has *rig*.

Here NP is not only mentioned as Diñnāga's own work, but also a line is quoted from it. Haribhadrasūri is, therefore, quite right when he explains the word *अन्यत्र* (gshan las, § 65, p. 8) by "प्रमाण-समुच्चयौ."

There are some references to Diñnāga or his works in Kumārila's *Ślokavārtika*. While some of these references are made from PS the others are from NP as evident also from the commentary, *Nyāyara-tnākara*, by Pārthasārathi Miśra, on the *Ślokavārtika* (Chaukhamba S. Series, 1898). Among the nine *pakṣābhāṣas* (phyogs ltar. snan. ba, § 11) the first is *pratyakṣaviruddha* (mñon. sum. gyis. bsal. ba) and its example is *अभावना शब्द इति* (sgra. mñan. bya. ma. yin. shes. pa. lta buḥo). Kumārila refutes it thus (I. 1. 5, Anumāna, vv. 59-60, pp. 364-365):

"समाख्या तु शब्दादेः प्रत्यक्षेण निरस्यते ॥
तेषामभावत्वादि विरुद्धमनुमानतः ।
नहि भावना नाम प्रत्यक्षेणान्वस्यते ॥"

According to the characteristics of *pratyakṣa* as explained by Diñnāga (§ 54; PS I, 3; NB p. 103), *śrāvṇatva* is a *viśaya* of *anumāna* and not of *pratyakṣa*. This point is raised by Haribhadra in his *Nyāyapradeśavṛtti*: "भावनास्य सामान्यलक्षणत्वात् प्रत्यक्षगम्यत्वे च भवति, कथं प्रत्यक्ष-प्रतिवृत्तये विरुद्धम्?" The example (अभावना शब्दः) may, therefore, be of an *anumāna-viruddha* and not of *pratyakṣaviruddha*, as the author says. Thus with reference to the passage quoted above Pārthasārathi Miśra comments: "अनुमानविरोधमुदाहरति तेषामिति । दिङ् ना य स्त्विदं प्रत्यक्षविरोधोदाहरणमिच्छति । सति यच्छेति भवेति ।" Here it refers to the NP (p 2, §11) as the passage occurs there. It is also clear from it that according to Pārthasārathi Miśra this example does not allude to NB of Dharmakīrti though it is to be found also there. (p. 111).

In commenting on Kumārila's threefold *śabdaviruddha* ("विषय-शब्दविरोधः," pp. 61-63) Pārthasārathi Miśra writes: "जननी मे वन्द्येति । सोऽयं स्ववचनविरोध इति ।" This reminds us at once of our "स्ववचनविरुद्धो यदा माता मे वन्द्येति ।" in NP (§ 16).

Regarding *sarvalokaviruddha* which is the same as our *lokaviruddha* (bjig. tren. pas. bsal. ba or bjig. rten. gyis. gnod. pa, §§11, 14) Kumārila has (pp. 64-65):

"अदृश्यामिषेयत्वं शक्तिनो यो निवेपति ॥
स सर्वलोकादिदेन चन्द्रज्ञानेन बाध्यते ।"

This is with reference to "शक्ती (Cb. lit. शराहः) न अदृशः" found in this connection neither in Skt. nor in T¹ of our NP, but in Ch and

We have the Chinese¹ translation of it by Hiuen-tsang and its Tibetan version (T²). As we have already seen, T² clearly says that the author is Dīnāga, and there is no mention whatever of Śaṅkarasūmin. It is further said in the colophon of T² that it was made with much care after having collected and corrected two books, one from China and the other from Tibet (rgyahi dpe.dān. bod.kyi. dpe. gñis. po. legs. par. btos. cin. bcos. te dag. par. bsgyur. ba ho|| p. 29). So at least at the time of this translation, Śaṅkarasūmin as the author of the work was unknown not only in Tibet but also in China to a large number of those who had much interest in it.

3. TRANSLATIONS OF THE NYĀYAPRAVEŚA.

First, it was translated from its original Skt. into Chinese (Ch) by Tripiṭakadharmācārya (*Sān tsūh fa shī*) Hiuen-tsang (647 A.D.), as is written at the very beginning of it and known from Chinese and Japanese sources. There is a Tibetan translation (T³) from this Chinese version. In the colophon of this Tibetan translation (T³) it is stated (p. 28, l. 28; p. 29, l. 1) that the Chinese version from which it is made was by a Chinese translator, Than Sañ Tsañ (rgyahi lo. tsa. ba. thañ. sañ. tsañ. gis. bsgyur. cin). This translator is no other than Hinen-tsang as interpreted by Cordier, III. p. 436, and accepted by scholars, though the three Chinese characters, Than Sañ Tsañ, do not give his name expressly, they simply mean 'Tripiṭaka of the Thān dynasty (618-907 A.D.)' This is, however, an abbreviation of the fuller form 'the master of the Tripiṭaka of the Thān period' and it refers to Hiuen-tsang, as says Cordier.

This Tibetan translation from the Chinese version was made, as mentioned there in the colophon (pp. 28, 29), by one Señ Gyañ Ju¹, a *kalyāṇamitra* of China, and Acārya Kumāra (Ston gshon), also a *kalyāṇamitra* of Tibet (p. 28). Then one Deva bhadranta Dharmaratna of Mahācīna belonging to Mahāsarvāstivādanikāya translated

1. As regards the name I have nothing to say. I am, however, glad to write what Dr. Tucci thinks of it. He says that *Señ* is certainly a very common name for a Buddhist monk. *Gyañ* is perhaps *yan*. Compare in the transliterated Chinese title of the book (gyen muñ gshai. ciñ. liñ. lun) *gyen* for *yan*. And this *yan* may correspond to the character which has the same pronunciation under the radical no. 170, nine strokes. (Owing to the want of Chinese character in the Press it could not be written here.) About Ju Dr. Tucci, too, has nothing to suggest.

it again in the great monastery of Śrīpīṇḍubhūmi in upper Tsang, Western Tibet, having collected and corrected two books, one from China and the other from Tibet (pp 28-29) I could not ascertain the date of this translation

There is another translation in Tibetan which is now edited for the first time (T¹) It is made direct from Sanskrit by one Śākya-bhikṣu Kīrttidhvaja Śrībhadrā with help from the Kāśmīraka mahāpanlita sarvajña Śrīrakṣita in the Mahāvīhara at Śrīpīṇḍubhūmi, i e., at the same place where the first translation was made (p 28) Cordier says that Kīrttidhvaja Śrībhadrā was probably the fifth hierarch of Śrīpīṇḍubhūmi, 1147-1216 A D

4 THE COMPARISON OF DIFFERENT VERSIONS

Now, a few words regarding the comparison of Skt with T¹, T² and Ch Instead of showing the points of agreement which are too many to mention, only the main divergences are here pointed out For the sake of convenience these divergences may be grouped here under thirteen heads as shown in the table given below

TABLE SHOWING THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN

I	T ¹ and Skt
	Notes 6, 16, 17 ^b 20, 32, 38 39, 44, 49, 50, 56, 59, 61, 63, 64, 78, 79, 82, 85 ^a , 85 ^b , 92, 95, 106, 107, 108 109, 125, 130, 134, 135.
II	T ¹ and Skt Ch T ² .
	Notes 13, 26, (Add Cor p 4, l 22,) 79, 88, 103, 116-117
III	T ² and Ch
	Notes 5, 15, 18, 49, 58, 79, 107, 116-117, 119, 120
IV	T ² and Ch Skt T ¹
	Notes 12, 24, 66, 67, 68, 73, 81, 97, 107, 115, 122, 126, 129, 134, 138
V	T ² and Ch Skt
	Note 20
VI	T ¹ T ² and Skt
	Notes 42, 64
VII	T ¹ T ² and Skt Ch
	Notes 8, 121
VIII	T ¹ T ² Ch and Skt
	Notes 3, 4, 9, 20, 40, 41, 48, 52 53, 74, 78, 102, 108
IX	Skt T ¹ and Ch T ²

- Notes 11, 21, 22, 55, 59, 60, 62, 66, 81, 82, 86, 87, 88, 89,
92, 93, 96, 98, 99, 104, 110, 116-117, 123, 125, 127, 130.
- X. Skt. and Ch. T¹ T².
Notes 30, 74, 75
- XI. Ch and Skt.
Notes 19, 27, 119.
- XII. Ch and Skt. T¹ T².
Note 23.
- XIII. Ch T¹ and Skt. T².
Notes 10, 65.

Readers may now draw their conclusion from this table as to the variation of readings in our NP, and the following lines may be helpful to them in this direction.

The difference between T¹ T² Ch and Skt. (VIII) is found in not less than twelve cases. Now, when there are these three different versions in agreement all differing from one, viz. Skt. we may safely arrive at the following conclusion:

In the Skt. text, p. 1, l. 7, originally there was no इति वाक्यशेषः (Note 3), nor was अगित्ये वा in l. 8. (Note 4). Cf. however, Note 8. On p. 3, l. 20 the reading must have been पदादिवत् for षट्वत् (Note 37), while before इति (l. 22) there was the word शब्दः (Note 40). The latter word was, however, not in the text before Haribhadra, but he thought it necessary and consequently he wrote in his *vr̥tti* (p. 26, l. 4) "शब्द इति गम्यते". According to these texts one may read असाम्बद्ध for असम्बद्ध (p. 4, l. 1; Note 41) though the latter is supported by Haribhadra; and अङ्गवत् for अङ्गविशेषवत् (p. 5, l. 10; Note 74), and this is supported also by NB and Haribhadra (p. 28). On the same ground we are to read (p. 4, l. 16) simply पूर्ववत् after एतदपि omitting विमुद्धत-साधर्म्येण (Note 52). The sentence नित्य-वाक्यशेषोऽस्तीति परमाशुबलम् (p. 6, ll. 19-20) is also to be omitted (Note 102). Again, for षट्वत् (p. 4, l. 8) one should read पदादिवत् (Note 48) as supported by them all (though in Ch the matter is put somewhat differently it is quite clear that there is षट्पदि and not simply षट्). Similarly आत्मनः (p. 5, l. 11) is to be omitted (Note 78). Also we cannot say that the line यत्र विना साध्यसाधननिवृत्त्या तद्विषयमात्रो निदर्शयते (p. 7, l. 5), though supported by the *vr̥tti* and the *Pañjikā* was originally in the text, as there is nothing of it in these three different texts (Note 108).

The difference between T¹ and Skt. (I) is noted in more than thirty cases. While in some cases the difference is immaterial it is

important in others. In Skt, p 1, l 9 with regard to the forms of हेतु we read "पक्षधर्मत्वं सपक्षे सत्त्वं विपक्षे चासत्त्वम्." The *Mahāvīryūtpatti*, §199 gives the same words with a slight variation "अनुमेये सत्त्वम्। सपक्षे सत्त्वम्। अपक्षे चासत्त्वम्।" The word निश्चित or निश्चय is not used here. But T¹ reads "एव एव सत्त्वनिश्चय, विपक्षे चासत्त्वनिश्चय एव" (Notes 4, 5), while Ch has सत्त्वनिश्चयसत्त्वम्, T² strictly following SLt. This reading of the words एव and निश्चय or निश्चित clearly shows its connection with NB (II, p 104) which runs here thus "अनुमेये सत्त्वमेव । सपक्ष एव सत्त्वम् । अपक्षे चासत्त्वमेव निश्चितम् ।" And the commentator, Dharmottaracārya, tells us (pp 22 ff.) that the word निश्चित is to be taken also with the preceding two sentences at the end. He also supports the use of the word एव. This is undoubtedly a later development or the true explanation traditionally handed down to the teachers though not recorded before. And, I think, T² gives here the original reading strictly following Skt. We have seen that T² was a very careful translation, though there are defects as will be shown later on. Hinen tsang does not make any mention of Dharmakīrti (about 635-650 A D.), though the latter was living at that time, yet, it is not improbable that the former used the word under discussion having taken it from the latter, or it may be that the above line of Dinnaga was then being interpreted by the contemporary scholars in that way as found in NB and Ch.

Sometimes T¹ has defective or worse readings (See Notes 49, 50, 52), and sometimes it gives also absolutely wrong ones. For instance, see Note 79. Here (p 5, ll 13-14), as Haribhadra explains, the reading must be गुणकर्मसु भावात्, but T¹ has गुणकर्मत्वभावात्, which cannot be accepted. Nor is the reading गुणकर्महेतोः supplied by Ch correct. T² is, however, right when it reads गुणकर्मभावात् which can be taken to mean गुणकर्मसु भावात्. See also Notes 82, 85.

As regards अव्यतिरेक (p 7, l 7) T¹ here gives an entirely different reading यथा जाकारो नित्यत्वमकृतकत्वं च दृष्टमिति (See Note 108). That this reading cannot be admitted is proved on two grounds. First, the main part of the syllogism, नित्यं चन्द्रो मूर्तत्वात् (p 6, ll 18-19), is common to all the versions the only difference being with regard to the words for दृष्टान्त, such as परमाणुत्वं (l 19), कर्मत्वं (p 7, l 1), etc. Thus there is no reason as to why the phrase नित्यं चन्द्रोऽमूर्तत्वात्, should not also be applied to the case of अव्यतिरेक. Secondly, the reading supplied by T¹ as quoted above is not an example of अव्यतिरेक as required, but of अद्वैति-व्यतिरेक not in our NP, but in NB, p 118.

(and PNT V. 78). The Example of it as given there is "यथा अनित्यः शब्दः कृतत्वं द्वाकासम्". T¹ differs from Skt., Ch and T² also with regard to the example of विपरीतव्यतिरेक (p. 7, l. 7) when it reads: "यदमित्यं (दद्) अकृतमिति वक्तव्ये यदकृतं तच्चित्तमित्युक्तमिति for "यदमित्यं तन्मूर्तं दृष्टमिति वक्तव्ये यन्मूर्तं तदमित्यं दृष्टमिति" in our Skt. text which is supported by both Ch and T² (See Note 108). The reading given here by T¹ is actually the same as for विपरीतव्यतिरेकदृष्टान्ताभास in NB, p. 118 (and PNT, V. 79, p. 119). See Note 109.

It is, therefore, evident from the above that T¹ in giving such different readings must have had some connection with NB, probably due to the translator himself who knew both the texts, NP and NB and seems to have confounded them when translating the former.

The difference between Skt. T¹ and Ch. T² (IX) is found in not less than twenty six cases. Let us consider here some of them which are important. It is found that sometimes the reading lost both in Skt. and T¹ are preserved by Ch. and T². For instance, as an illustration of लोदविहद् (p. 2, l. 20, § 14) the sentence यद्यी (Ch lit. यथाङ्गः) न चन्द्रः is found only in Ch and T². See Note 22. This passage, as we have already seen, with a slight different reading, अचन्द्रः for न चन्द्रः, occurs also in NB, p. 111, in connection with प्रतीक्षि- निराकृत (=लोकविहद्). Thus a doubt arises here as to whether it was taken by Hiuen-tsang from Dharmakīrti's NB or whether he gave us the actual reading of NP as it was before him. We know, Hiuen-tsang did not mention Dharmakīrti though they were contemporary. Yet, it is not improbable that the former was acquainted with the views of the latter. It may also be said that when at Nalanda (638 A. D.), Hiuen-tsang might have naturally been familiar with the Nyāya school of Dinnāga as it was developing at that time. So the illustration might have been taken by both Dharmakīrti and Hiuen-tsang from that traditional school, and the latter might have added it when translating the NP. But from this it does not follow that the reading in question could not originally have belonged to NP. In favour of this view it may be added that the reading is given also in T² which was so carefully made comparing both Ch and Tib. books.

On p. 3, l. 7 we read in the Skt. text उक्ताः पञ्चामासाः; similarly one may expect to read उक्ता देवामासाः after they are described on p. 5, l. 19. It is, however, not to be found there, but in Ch and T². See Note 87.

Again, it is Ch and T² and not Skt and T¹ that have preserved the original reading with regard to the example of प्रत्यक्षात्, p 7, l 21.* Here for the word °स्वच्छाविषयत्वात् in Skt and T¹ we should read °स्वच्छाविषयत्वात्, and it is actually found in Ch and T². See Note 123 and Add. Corr.

On the other hand, some times Ch and T² unnecessarily omit a few words. See Notes 55, 59, 60. On p 5 l 15, साक्ष्य is unnecessarily used twice in Skt and T¹, but Ch and T² omit them altogether as being easily understood. See Notes 81, 82.

In seven cases T¹ has differed from all others (II), but nowhere has it given any better reading, on the contrary, sometimes we have had or wrong readings in it. For instance, see Notes 13, 26, 79.

T² differs from Ch in ten places (III). In one of them it appears to have preserved the original reading as we have already noticed (under I). See Note 5. Once it has actually done so though it is omitted in Ch. See Note 58. Once T² has the same reading as in Skt though Ch reads it wrongly (Note 79). Similarly T² has a wrong reading once while Ch reads rightly (Note 107). In two cases T² unnecessarily adds something more than what is in Ch (Notes 119, 120). In some cases the difference between them is immaterial (Notes 15, 18, 116, 117).

In sixteen cases T² is found to have differed from other versions (IV), the important ones being as follow. For धर्मविशेषविपरीतसाधन (p 5, l 5) in all other versions T² reads धर्मविशेषविपरीतसाधन (Note 68), which cannot be accepted nor can one admit its reading उभयसाधन (p 7, l 14) for उभया साधन (Note 107). For नाममायादिकल्पना (p 7 l 14) it has व्यक्तादिकल्पना which is not better than the former (Note 115). In the phrase कल्पनाज्ञानमयोन्तरे (p 7 l 19) T² omits अर्थान्तरे which does not seem to be absolutely necessary. As shown in Note 134 the reading found in T² cannot be supported.

Only in one instance T² differs from Skt. Ch agreeing, however, with T¹ (V) and this is with reference to the last पक्षमात्र called प्रतिद्वयस्य च (Note 20). Both T¹ and T² are wrong here. T¹ and T² differ from Skt and Ch (VII) only twice (Notes 8, 121), and there is only one case (Note 23) where Ch differs from all (XII). But the point of difference is very insignificant. In two cases it is noticed that T¹ and T² differ not only from each other but also from Skt (VI. Notes 42, 44).

§ 10. hdi. rnams. sgrub. par. byed. pa. rnams. yin. no
(एतानि साधनानि).

II. sgrub. par. byed. pa. ltar. snañ. ba. rnams. so
(साधनाभासाः):

A. phyogs. ltar. snañ. ba (पक्षभासाः),

B. gtan. tshigs. ltar. snañ. ba (हेतुभासाः),

C. dpe. ltar. snañ. ba (दृष्टान्ताभासाः).

§ 11. A. phyogs. ltar. snañ. ba. rnams (पक्षभासाः) 9:

§ 12. (i) mñon. suni. gyis. gnod. pa (प्रत्यक्षविषयः),

§ 13. (ii) rjes su. dpag. pas g° (अनुमानवि°),

§ 14. (iii) rjig. rten gyis g° (लोकवि°),

§ 15. (iv) yid. ches. pas g° (आप्तमवि°),

§ 16. (v) rañ. gi. tshig. gis g° (स्ववचनवि°),

§ 17. (vi) khyad. par. rab. tu. grags. pa. ma. yin.
pa (अप्रसिद्धविशेषणः),

§ 18. (vii) khyad. par. cau. rab. tu. grags. pa. ma.
yin. pa (अप्रसिद्धविशेष्यः),

§ 19. (viii) gñis. ka. rab. tu. grags. pa. ma. yin. pa
(अप्रसिद्धोभयः),

§ 20. (ix) rab. tu. grags. pa. dañ. hbrel (असिद्धसम्बन्धः).

§ 21. hdi. rnams. dam. beah. bañ. skyon. rnams. so
(एते प्रतिज्ञादोषाः).

§ 22. B. gtan. tshigs. ltar. snañ. ba. rnams. so (हेतुभासाः) 3:

(i) ma. grub. pa (अविद्धः),

(ii) ma. ñes. pa (अनैकान्तिकः),

(iii) hgal. ba (विरुद्धः).

§ 23. (i) ma. grub. pa. rnams (अविद्धाः) 4:

§ 24. (a). gñis. ka. la. ma. grub. pa (उभयासिद्धः),

§ 25. (b). gañ. ruñ. la. ma. grub. pa (अन्यतरा°),

§ 26. (c) the. tsom. za. nas. ma grub. pa (सन्दिग्धा°),

§ 27. (d) gñi. ma. grub. pa (आभया°).

§ 28. (ii) ma. ñes. pa. rnams (अनैकान्तिकाः) 6:

§ 29. (a) thun. moñ (साधारणः),

§ 30. (b) thun. moñ. ma. yin. pa (असाधारणः),

§ 31. (c) mathun. phyogs. kyi. phyos. gcig. la. yod. la.

- mi mthun. phyogs la. khyab. pa (समष्टिकदेशरूति-
विशद्व्यापी),
- § 32. (a) mi. mthun. phyogs gcig. gi. yul. la. yod. la.
mthun. phyogs. la. khyab. pa (विषष्टिकदेशरूतिः सप्त-
व्यापी),
- § 33. (e) gñis. lali. phyogs. cig. gi. yul. la. yod. pa
(उभयपक्षैकदेशरूतिः),
- § 34. (f) hgal. ba. la. mi. lkhrol. ba (विद्वद्वाच्यव्यापी).
- § 35. (iii) hgal. ba. ruams (विद्वत्.) 4:
- § 36. (a) chos. kyī. ran. bshin. phyin. ci. log. tu.
sgrub. par. byed. pa (धर्मस्वरूपविपरीतसाधन),
- § 37. (b) chos. kyī. lhyad. par. phyin° (धर्मविरुद्धवि°),
- § 38. (c) chos. can. gyi. ran. bshin. phyin° (धर्म-
स्वरूपवि°),
- § 39. (d) chos. can. gyi. lhyad. par. phyin° (धर्म-
विरुद्धवि°).
- § 40. C. dpe. ltar. suan. ba. ruams (रुन्ताभासाः) 2:
- (i) chos. mthun. pa. ñid. kyis (साधर्म्येण),
- (ii) chos. mi. mthun. pa. ñid. kyis (वैधर्म्येण).
- (i) chos. mthun. pa. ñid. kyis. dpe. ltar. suan. ba.
ruams (साधर्म्येण रुन्ताभासाः) 5:
- § 42. (a) sgrub. par. byed. pañi chos. ma. grub. pa
(साधनपरमोद्दिष्टः),
- § 43. (b) bsgrub. byali. chos. ma° (साधनपरम°),
- § 44. (c) gñis. ka. ma° (उभय°),
- § 45. (d) rjes. su. lgro. ba. med. pa (अन.वय).
§ 46. (e) rjes. su. hgro. ba. phyin. ci. log. pa (निरु-
तन्वयः),
- (n) chos. mi. mthun. pa. ñid. kyis dpe. ltar. suan. ba.
ruams (वैधर्म्येण रुन्ताभासाः) 5:
- § 47. (a) sgrub. par. byed. pa. ldog. pa. med (साधना-
व्याप्तः),
- § 48. (b) bsgrub. par. bya. ba. ldog° (साधनव्याप्त°),
- § 49. (c) gñis. ka. ldog° (उभयव्याप्त°),
- § 50. (d) ldog. pa. med. pa (अव्यतिरेकः),
- § 51. (e) ldog. pa. phyin. ci. log. pa (निरुद्धव्यतिरेकः).

§ 52 hdi rnams ni sgrub par byed par ltar. snan. ba
rnams so (एते साधनाभासाः),

§ 53 III tshad ma dag (प्रमाणे) 2.

§ 54 (i) mnon sum (प्रत्यक्षम्),

§ 55 (ii) rjes su dpag pa (अनुमानम्)

§ 56 rtags (लिङ्गम्)

§ 57, kbras bu (फलम्).

IV tshad ma ltar snan ba rnams (प्रमाणभासाः) 2.

§ 59 (i) mnon sum ltar snan ba (प्रत्यक्षाभासाः);

§ 60 (ii) rjes su dpag ltar snan ba (अनुमानभासाः).

§ 61 V sun hbyin pa rnams (दूषणानि) 3

§ 62, (i) sgrub par byed pahı skyon (साधनदोषः),

(ii) phyogs kyi skyon (पक्षदोषः),

(iii) rtags kyi skyon (हेतुदोषः).

§ 64 VI sun hbyin ltar snan ba rnams (दूषणभासाः) 5

(i) ma tshan ba űud brjod pa (न्यूनत्ववचनम्),

(ii) phyogs kyi skyon brjod pa (पक्षदोषवचनम्),

(iii) ma grub pahı rtags su brjod pa (अधिकहेतुत्ववचनम्),

(iv) ma űes pahı rtags su brjod pa (अनेकान्तहेतुत्ववचनम्),

(v) hgal, bahı rtags su, brjod pa (विरुद्धहेतुत्ववचनम्).

TIBETAN TEXT

RGYA GAR SKAD DU᠊ NYĀ YA PRA VE CA NA MA
 PRA MĀ NA PRA KA RA NA᠊ BOD SKAD DU᠊
 TSHAD MA RIGS PAR HJUG PAHI SGO
 SHES BYA BAHĪ RAB TU BYED PA᠊



hjam dpal gshon nur gyur pa la
 phyag htshal lo᠊

1 sgrub pa dan nī sun hbyin űid᠊
 ltar snan bcas pa gshan rtogs phyir᠊
 mnon sum dan nī rjes su dpag᠊
 ltar snan bcas pa bdag rig phyir᠊
 ces pa bstan bcos bsdus paho᠊

2 de la phyogs la sogs pa brjod pa rñams sgrub par byed
 pa ste᠊ phyogs dan gtan tshigs dan dpe brjod pa rñams nī
 phyir rgol.rñams kyis ma rtogs pahi don rab tu rtogs par byed
 pahi phyir ro shes paho᠊

3 de la phyogs nī rab tu grags pahi chos can rab tu
 grags pahi khyad par gyis khyad par du byas pa ran gis sgrub -
 bya kho nar bdod pa mnon sum la sogs pas gnod pa med pa
 can hdi lta ste᠊ sgra mī rtag ces na lta buho᠊

4 gtan tshigs nī tshul gsum mo᠊ tshul gsum po de yan
 gan she na᠊ phyogs lyi chos űid dan᠊ mthun pahi phyogs űid la
 yod par nes pa dan᠊ mī mthun pahi phyogs la med pa űid du
 nes pa yan no᠊

5 mthun pahi phyogs de yan gan᠊ mī mthun pahi phyogs
 de gan she na᠊ bsgrub par bya bahi chos lyi spyis don mtshuns
 pa űid mthun pahi phyogs te᠊ hdi ltar sgra mu rtag par bsgrub
 pa la bum pa la sogs pa yan mī rtag pa yin pas mthun -
 phyogs so᠊

6 mī mthun pahi phyogs nī gan la bsgrub par bya ba
 med pa ste᠊ gan rtag pa yin pa de 'byas pa ma yin par
 mthon ste᠊ dper na nam mlahā bshin shes pal o᠊ de la byas

1 After yin MS and C read *par lot pa om ting de*

pa.ñid. dam! btsal.ma.thag.tu.byuñ.ba. ²phyogs.kyi. chos.ñid.
 dañ. bsgrub.par.byā.ba. med.pa. ñid.du. ñes.pa.³ shes.pa. mi.
 rtag.pa.la. gtan.tshigs.so ॥

7. dpe.ni. gñis.su.dbye. ste! chos.mthun.pa. dañ! chos.
 mi.mthun.pa. yañ.ño. ॥

8. de.la. chos.mthun.pa. ni. gañ.la. gtan.tshigs.kyi. mthun.
 pahi.phyogs. ñid.la. yod.pa. ston.pa. ste! gañ. byas.pa. de. mi.rtag.
 par. mthoñ. ste! dper.na. bum.pa.la.sogs.pa. bshin. shes.paho ॥

9. chos. mi.mthun. pa. yañ! gañ.la. bsgrub. par. byā.ba.
 med.pa.la. rtag. med.pa. ñid.du. ston.pa. ste! gañ. rtag.pa. de.
 byas. pa.ma.yin. te! dper.na. nam.mkhah. bshin. shes.paho. ॥
 rtag.pahi.sgras. ni. bdir. mi.rtag.pa.ñid. med.par.brjod.pa. yin.la.²¹
 byas.pa.ma. yin. pahi. sgras. kyañ. byas.pa.med.par. ro! ji.ltar. yod.
 dañ. med.dag. yod. ces. smras.pa. phyogs.la.sogs. pa.rnams.so ॥

10. hdi.rnams.kyi. brjod.pa.rnams. ni. gshan.gyis. rab.tu.
 rtogs. pahi. dus.na. sgrub.par.byed.pa.ste! hdi.ltar. sgra. mi.rtag.
 ces.pa. ni. phyogs.brjod.paho! byas.pahi. phyir. shes.pa. phyogs.kyi.
 chos. brjod.pa. ñid.do! gañ. byas.pa. de. mi.³ rtag.par.⁴ mthoñ.
 ste! dper.na. bum.pa.bshin. shes.pa. mthun.⁵ phyogs.la. rjes.su.
 hgro. bar. brjod. do! gañ. rtag.pa. yin. pa. de. byas.pa.ma.yin. par.
 mthoñ. ste! dper.na. nam.mkhah.la. sogs.pa.bshin. shes.pa. bzlog-
 pa. brjod.paho ॥

hdi.rnams ñid. gsum. yan.lag ces. brjod.do ॥

11. bsgrub.par. byā.bar.hdod.pa.la. yañ. mñon.sum.⁶la.
 sogs.pas.bsāl.ba.rnams. phyogs.ltar.snañ.ba ste! hdi.ltar. mñon.
 sum.gyis. bsāl.ba. dañ! rjes.su. dpag.pas. bsāl.ba. dañ! hji.g.rten.
 pas.bsāl.ba. dañ! yid. ches.pas. bsāl.ba. dañ! rañ.gi. tshig.gis.
 bsāl.ba. dañ! khyad. par.rab.tu.grags.pa.ma.yin.pa. dañ! khyad.
 par.cau. rab.tu.grags.pa. ma.yin.pa. dañ! gñis.ka.rab.tu.grags.
 pa.ma.yin.pa. dañ! grags. pas.bsāl.ba.⁷ yañ. ste. shes.so ॥

12. de.la. mñon.sum.gyis. guod.pa. ni. dper.na. sgra. mñan-
 byā.ba. ma.yin. shes.pa.lta.buho ॥

2. The meaning of *phyogs. kyi. ñes pa.* is not quite clear.

2a. Read *pa* for *la*.

3. All *ni*, but as the sense requires it must be read *mi*.

4. After *par* A adds *yañ* which is superfluous.

5. C *mthun*.

6. All *gsum*.

7. See §20 and the *Comparative Notes*, *prāsiddhasambandha*. §§ 11, 20.

13. rjes su dpag pas guod pa ni dper na hum pa rtag ces pa lta buho ||

• 14. hjig tten gyis guod pa ni dper na mhu mgo thod gtsan stei sems can gyi yan lag yin pahi phyir dun dan fia phyis ces pa bshin shes pa lta buho ||

15. yid ches pas guod pa ni dper na bye brag pas sgra. rtag ces bsgrub pa lta buho ||

16. ran gi tshig gis guod pa ni dper na nal ma mo gcam shes. pa lta buho ||

17. khyad par rab tu grags pa ma yin pa ni dper na snas rgyas pas grans can pa la sgra hjig ces pa lta buho ||

18. khyad par can rab tu grags pa ma yin pa ni dper na grans can pas snas rgyas pa la bdag ni sems dpah can shes pa lta buho ||

19. gñis ka rab tu grags pa ma yin pa ni dper na bye brag pas snas rgyas pa la bdag ni bde ba la sogs pa hdu bar byed pa can shes pa lta buho ||

20. rab tu grags pa¹ yan hbrei tei dper na me dro ba med ces pa lta buho ||

21. hdi rnams kyi brjed pa ni chos kyi ran bshin hgog par byed pahi sgo stei yan dag par rab tu rtogs pa med pa dan sgrub par byed pa hbras bu med pahi phyir dam beah baki skyon rnams so ||

22. ma grub pa dan ma ues pa dan lgal ba stei gsum pa rnams⁸ ni gtau tshigs⁹ lta¹⁰ snan ba rnams so ||

23. de la ma grub pahi dbye ba bshu stei gñis ka la ma grub pa dan gan yan run ba la ma grub pa dan the tshom za nas ma grub pa dan gshi ma grub pa¹⁰ yan no shes paho ||

24. de la sgra ni rtag ñid sgrub pa la mig gis gzun bar bya ba ñid kyi phyir shes pa gñis ka la ma grub paho ||

25. sgra mnon par gsal bar smra ba la byas pa ñid kyi phyir shes pa gan run la ma grub paho ||

8 *gsum pa rnams* means *tsīṣyāh* which has no sense here. Evidently it is used here to mean *trayāh*.

9 *V tshig* for *tshigs*.

10 *T¹ gñis grub pa* which is evidently wrong. C and T² are, however, very clear *gshi ma grub pa*. See § 27.

26. me. sgrub.pa.la. rlaṅs.pa.la.sogs.pahi. dños.por. the.-
tshom.za.bahi.hbyuñ.ba. ḥdus.pa. brjod.pa. lta.bu. the.tshom.za.
nas.ma.grub.pahoṃ

27. nam.mkhahrdzas.su.yod.de.tyon.tan.gyi.gshi.ñid.kyi.-
phyir.shes.pa. nam.mkhahi.yod.¹¹pa.ñid. du.brjod.pa.la. gshi.-
ma.grub.pahoṃ

28. ma.ñes.pa. ni. drug.du.dbye. ste.t thun.moñ. danṅ
thun.moñ.ma.yin.pa. danṅ mthun.phyogs.kyi. phyogs.gcig.¹² la.
yod.la.mi.mthun.phyogs.la. khyab.pa. danṅ mi.mthun.phyogs.-
kyi. phyogs.gcig. gi.yul.la.yod.la. mthun.phyogs.la. khyab.pa.
danṅ gñis.kahi. phyogs.cig. gi.yul.la.yod.pa. danṅ hgal.ba.la.
mi.khrul.ba.yaṅ.shes.pahoṃ

29. de.la. thun.moñ.ba. ḥdi.ltar. gshal.bya.ñid.kyi.phyir.
sgra.rtag.ces.pahoṃ de.ni.rtag.mi.rtag.gi.phyogs.dag.la.
thun.moñ.ba.ñid.kyi.phyir.ma.ñes.pa.ste.ji.¹³ltar.bum.pa.
la.sogs.pa.bshin.gshal.bya.ñid.kyi.phyir.rtag.ces.pa.lta.buho¹⁴

30. thun.mon.ma.yin.pa.ni.mñan.bya.ñid.kyi.phyir.sgra.
rtag.ces.pahoṃ de.ni.rtag.mi.rtag.gi.phyogs.dag.las.ldog.pa.-
ñid.kyi.phyir.danṅ rtag.mi.rtag.gi.ruam.par.ñes.pa.spañs.pahi.
gshan.yaṅ.med.pahi.phyir mñan.bya.ñid. ḥdi.ji.ltar.na.the.-
tshom.gyi. rgyu.ñid.do.shes.pahoṃ

31. mthun.phyogs.kyi.phyogs.cig.gi.¹⁵yul.la.yod.la.mi.-
mthun.phyogs.la.khyab.pa.ni.sgra.rtsol.bas.byuñ.ba.ma.yin.
te.¹⁶mi.rtag.pa.ñid.kyi.phyir.shes.pahoṃ ḥdihi.¹⁷mi.mthun.pahi.
phyogs.ni.rtsol.ba.las.byuñ.¹⁸bahoṃ glog.¹⁹dan.nam.mkhah-
la.sogs.pa.ni.mthun.phyogs.soṃ de.la.yul.gcig.glog.la.sogs.

11. It must be read *med* as in T².

12. Here *gi.yul.* is to be supplied before *la*.

13. Originally *ḥdi* but corrected to *ji* according to A and it is supported by V.

14. Evidently the reading here is defective and omits some words for Skt. "उद् आराधित्व आकाशम् प्रवेष्ट्वा नित्यं हस्ति।"

15. MS *gis* for *gi*.

16. *rtsol.bas.byuñ.ba.ma.yin* means *prayatnānūlpanna*, but the actual reading should be *blsal.ma.theg.tu.byuñ.ba.* meaning *prayatnānūlārīyaka*, or *prayatmanūlārīyaka*, as supported by T¹ and T². See § 6, p 2, l. 1.

17. MS *ḥdaḥ*.

18. See Note 16.

19. MS *Cglog*.

pa la. mi.rtag.pa.ñid. yod.la. nam.mkhah la.sogs.pa.la. med. kyi. phyir.^{19a} hdihi mthun.phyogs. rtsol.ma byun. dan. mi mthun. phyogs bum.pa.la.sogs.paho|| de la thams.cad.la. mi.rtag pa. ñid. yod.la. hdihi²⁰ yan. glog. dan. bum pa. chos mthun.pahi.phyir. ma.nes - paho|| ji.ltar. bum pa.la.sogs.pa.bshin. mi rtag.pa ñid. kyi.phyir. rtsol.ba las.byun shes. pa lta. buho ||²¹

32. mi mthun phyogs kyi.yul.gcig.la. yod la. mthun phyogs. la.khyab. pa ni. ji.ltar. sgra. rtsol ba.las byun ba yin. te. mi.rtag.pa ñid. kyi phyir. shes paho|| rtsol ba las byun bñi.sgra. ni. hdihi. phyogs so|| bum pa la sogs pa ni. mthun²² phyogs|| de.la. bum pa.la.sogs pa. thams cad.la. mi.rtag pa ñid do|| glog. dan nam mkhah.la.sogs.pa. ni. mi mthun.phyogs so|| de la glog. la.sogs pa la. mi rtag pa ñid. yod la. nam mkhah la sogs pa.la. med.pa. dehi phyir. hdi yan. sua.ma bshin ma nes paho||

33. gñis lahi phyogs gcig.gi yul la. yod pa. ni ji.ltar. sgra. rtag. ste. lus can ma yin pa ñid.kyi phyir. shes pa|| hdi.la. rtag. pa.ni. phyogs so||²³ nam mkhah dan rdul phran la sogs pa. ni. mthun.²⁴phyogs so|| de la. mthun²⁵phyogs kyi - yul cig. nam mkhah la. lus can ma yin pa ñid yod la rdul phran la - sogs pa.la. med do|| hdihi mi rtag pahi phyogs. bum pa dan. bde ba la sogs pa ni. mi mthun phyogs so|| de la. bde ba la - sogs pa ni. lus can.ma yin pa ñid yod la bum pa la med do|| dehi phyir hdi. yan. bde ba. dan nam mkhah chos mthun pahi. dper. byas pa ñid kyi. ma nes paho||

34. hgal ba la. mi hkbrul.ba ni. ji.ltar sgra. mi rtag.te. byas pa ñid kyi phyir. bum pa bshin|| sgra. rtag Ste. mñan.byas. ñid.kyi phyir sgra bshin.²⁶ shes pa. i hgal bñi. don dag. gcig.la. yod pa. ni. gñis.la la. the tshom.gyi rgyu ñid.do ||

35. hgal ba. ni bshir dbye ste|| chos kyi ran bshin phyin. - ci.log.tu sgrub par byed pa. dan|| chos kyi khyad par phyin.ci -

19a MS omits it

20. For *hdihi* read *hdi* as in §32, last line, §33, last line but one.

21. Here '*ahoroti . aprayatnāntarīyaka it'*' of Skt is omitted altogether.

22. All *thun* See Notes 24, 25

23 According to Skt the sentence should not end here

24 MS *mthun* corrected to *kñhun* according to A C and V also read *kñhun* which is another form of *mthun*

25. MS *thun* In C one letter before *thun* seems to have faded away.

26 According to Skt the reading should be as in T² *sgra ñid bshin*

log.tu. sgrub. par. byed.pa. dan; chos.can gyi. ran.bshin. phyin.-
ci.log.tu. sgrub. par. byed pa. dan; chos.can gyi. lhyad.par.
phyin.ci.log.tu. bsgrub.par. byed.pa. yañ.no. shes.paño ||

36. de la. chos.kyi.ran.bshin.phyin.ci.log.tu.sgrub.par.
byed.pa. ji.ltar.na. sgra. rtag. ste. byas.pa.ñid.kyi. phyir. shes.pa-
ham. btsal.ma.thag.tu. byuñ.ba.ñid.kyi.phyir; shes hdi.²⁷ rtags.
mi.mithun.phyogs. lho. na.la. yod pas. hgal. baño ||

37. chos.kyi.lhyad.par.phyin.ci.log.tu. sgrub.par. byed.pa.
ji.ltar.na. mig.la.sogs.pa. gshan.²⁸gyi.don. yin. te; hdus. pa.ñid.-
kyi.phyir. mal.cha. dan. stan.la.sogs.pahi. yan.lag bshin. shes.pa.
ñid. rtags. ji.ltar. mig.la.sogs.pa.rnams.la. gshan.gyi.don.ñid.-
sgrub.par. byed.pa. de.ltar. hdus.pa.ñid.kyañ. gshan.gyi. sgrub.-
par.byed.pa. yin.la. mal.cha. dan. stan.la.sogs.pahi. yan.lag.rnams.
kyañ.hdus.pa.ñid.yin.pas.so ||

38. chos.can.gyi.ran.bshin.phyin.ci.log.du.sgrub.par.byed-
pa. ji.ltar.na. rdzas. dan. las. dan. yon.tan. dnos.²⁹med.de.ñnos.-
pohi. rdzas. gcig.pa.can.ñid.kyi.phyir. dan; yon.tan. dan. las.kyi.-
ran.bshin.yin.pahi.phyir; spyi. dan. khyad.par.bshin. shes.pa;
hdi. rtags. ji.ltar. rdzas.la.sogs.pahi. ma.yin.pa.la. sgrub.par.-
byed.pahi. dnos.po.yin.pa. de.ltar. dnos.pohi. yod.pa.ñid.la. yañ.
bsgrub.par. byed.pa. yin. te; gñis.la.la. mi.hkrul.bahi. phyir.ro ||

39. chos.can.gyi.lhyad.par.phyin.ci. log.tu. sgrub.par.byed.-
pa.³⁰hdi.ñid. ni. phyogs.sua.mahi. rtags. hdi.ñid.la. chos.can.-
gyi.lhyad.par. gan. yod.pa. rkyen.gyis. byas.³¹pa.ñid. dan. dehi.
bzlog.pa.rned.pa.rkyen.gyis. byas.pa.ñid.la. yañ. sgrub.par.-
byad.pa. yin. te; gñis.la.la.mi.hkrul.bahi. phyir.ro ||

40. dpe.ltar.snañ.ba.rnams. hdi.lta.³²ste; sgrub.par.byed.

27. MS *hdi*.

28. MS *gshan*, C *gshan*, ni, V *gshan*, T² gives the correct reading.

29. T¹ differing from all the versions, Skt. Ch T² reads *rdzas*.
das, *las*, *das*, *yon.tan*, so *rd*, *ni*, *del* It may be translated:
dravyam karma gaurā ca pūṣṭaṃ na dāraś, or it may also be translated:
na dravyam, na karma, na gaurā pūṣṭaṃ dāraś Evidently in the place of
rd *rd* the actual reading should have been *das*, *rd*, T² has *dāraś*
or *dāraś* *rd* (and *rd*, *ni*), while Ch has simply *dāraś*.

30. Here *ji*, *lta*, *na* should be supplied according to Skt.

31. MS writes *byas* striking off *byed*, V also has *byas*.

32. V wrongly reads *rd* for *lta*. The true reading seems to be *lta*
'Ere.' Cf. Skt. *śaś* *śaś*.

COMPARATIVE NOTES

COMPARATIVE NOTES

The figures to the left refer to the pages and lines respectively in the Skt. text.

- 1 3 शास्त्रार्थ०. अर्थ is omitted in T¹. Ch reads सर्वशास्त्रशास्त्रार्थ¹. 1^a.
- " " प्रतिपाद्यत इति. T¹ has प्रत्याव्यत इति . (rab.tu.rtog.s.par.byed.pahi.phyir.ro. shes.paho ||) 1^b.
- " 7 After साध्यत्वेन T¹ adds here एव (kho. nar). 2.
- " " इति वाक्यशेषः is not in T¹ T² Ch.
- " 8 नित्यः शब्दोऽनित्यो वा. Here T¹ T Ch read only शब्दोऽनित्यः and not नित्यः शब्दोऽनित्यो वा as in Skt. 4.
- " 9 सपक्षे सत्त्वम्. T¹ सपक्ष एव सत्त्वनिश्चयः (mthun.pahi.pyogs.ñid. la.yod.par.ñes.pa). T² follows Skt. while Ch reads सपक्षे निश्चयसत्त्वम्². 5.
- " " विपक्षे नासत्त्वम्. T¹ reads विपक्षे च असत्त्वनिश्चय एव (mi.mthun.pahi. phyogs.la. med.pa.ñid.du. ñes.pa. yañ.ño). T² Ch follow Skt. 6.
- " " °विश्व इति. T¹ T² add here चेत् 'if' (she.na) while Ch has उक्त¹ 'said' (wez)³ omitting इति. 7.
- " 13-15 तत्र कृतकत्वं अनित्यादौ हेतुः. T¹ reads: de.la. byas.pa.ñid. dam | btsal.ma.thag.tu.byuñ.ba. phyogs.kyi.chos. ñid. dan. bsgrub.par bya.ba.med. pa. ñid.du. ñes. pa. shes. pa. mi.rtag.pa.la. gtan.tsbigs.so || It may be translated thus:—तत्र कृतकत्वं प्रत्यक्षानन्तरीयकत्वं वा पक्षधर्म एव साप्याभाव एव च निश्चय इति अनित्ये हेतुः. But it is not clear. Ch reads तत्र कृतकत्वं प्रत्यक्षानन्तरीयकत्वं वा सर्वथा पक्षधर्म एव, सपक्षे निश्चितग्रहणेन, विपक्षे सर्वथा नास्त्येव इति अनित्यादौ हेतुः⁴. T² follows Ch. It is to be noted here that at the end of the sentence there is अनित्यादि ("अनित्यादौ") both in Skt. and Ch, but in T¹ and T² there is only अनित्य (mi.rtag.pa.) and not आदि (la.sogs. pa) added to it. 8.
- 1 15-16 साधर्म्येण वैधर्म्येण च. T¹ T² Ch सधर्मो विधर्मश्च. 9.
- 2 3 तदप्या. T¹ Ch omit this. 10.
- " 4 After आकाश Ch adds आदि (leng)⁵. T² follows it. 11.

- 2 4 5 Here T² differing from all the versions defines अत्रित्य and
 कृतक and not नित्य and अकृतक respectively 12
- 5 6 यथा^० मात्र इति T¹ reads यथा भावाभावौ भाव इति (yā ltar yod dan
 med dag yod ces) Evidently it is wrong 13
- 7 पर^० T¹ has परण (gshan gyis) 14
- 8 9 कृतकत्वादिति पक्षधर्मवचनम् T² differing from Ch reads कृतकत्वाद् हेतो
 (byas pahi phyir ni gtau tshigs yin no) 15
- 9 तदनित्यम् T¹ तन्नित्यम् (de ni rtag par) which is wrong The ac
 tual reading there seems to be *de ni rtag par* (तदनित्यम्) 16
- 10 यदादि T¹ has यट instead of यदादि as in Skt 17*
- 11 आकाशम् T¹ has आकाशादि (nam mkhaḥ la sogs pa) 17*
- 12 पञ्चानां Ch appears to read साध्य (or धारण) पञ्चानां^० whiel
 T² reads साध्यानां (bsgrub bya ltar snan no) 18
- 13 आयमविरुद्ध In T¹ आयमविरुद्ध (yid ches pas bsal ba, *lit*
 विश्वायविरुद्ध) is after लोकविरुद्ध Ch reads here स्वसिद्धान्तविरुद्ध 19
- 16-17 प्रसिद्धसम्बन्ध T² grags pas bsal ba It can be translated
 by प्रसिद्धिविरुद्ध But in illustrating it below the reading is
 rab tu grags pa dan hbrei = प्रसिद्धसम्बन्ध The reading in
 the text should be corrected accordingly

In T² in the fourth place the same phrase (i.e. grags
 pas bsal ba) occurs and is illustrated by the same
 example as in Skt adding, however a little more as
 in Ch Ch strictly follows Skt excepting the last term
 which it reads as परस्परसम्बन्धप्रसिद्ध* T¹ has परस्परसिद्ध (phan
 tshun grub pa ho) After स्वस्वविरुद्ध (T¹ ran gi
 tshig gi bsal ba dan T² ran gi tshig gi bsal ba
 dan) T² differs in giving the remaining terms from
 both Skt and Ch For, we read in it bsgrub byaḥ chos
 ma grub pa dan (= साध्यव्यासिद्ध) ; bsgrub byaḥ chos
 can ma grub dan (= साध्यव्यासिद्ध) ; guis la ma grub pa
 dan (= उभयासिद्ध) ; phan tshun grub pa ho (= परस्पर
 सिद्ध) ॥ As regards the first two terms it is to be observ
 ed that the words धर्म and धर्मिन् convey the same things as
 the words विरोध and विरोध respectively in other versions
 In illustrating the last term it says *sgza ni man bya*
yi no (= यद् भावण) See Note on भावण शब्द इति, below, 3

- 4-5. It is to be noted that the first two of the above terms are somewhat different when they are illustrated, for they are given as चर्मसिद्ध (chos.ma.grub.pa) and चर्मसिद्ध (chos.can.ma.grub.pa) respectively. 20.
- 2 18 बिलो चट इति. After चट Ch and T² add आदि (léng, and la., sog.s.pa respectively). 21.
- „ 20 Before बुचि नर° Ch and T² add चन्द्रो न दशङ्को वस्तुत्वात् (or भावात्); Ch.: *hnar t'u lei yueh yu ku*²; T². ri.boñ.can. zla. ba. ma. yin. te t yod pañi. phyir t 22.
- „ 20 After कण्ठं Ch adds सर्ग- (chang). 23.
- „ 21 बह्वचरित्व. T² बह्वचरित्व (duñ.chos.bshin). 24.
- „ 22 माता. T¹ T² ma.mo which generally means a 'grand-mother.' It may also mean a 'mother.' Cf. ma.mohi.ma = a 'mother of mother', an epithet of Pārvatī. 25.
3. 2 चेतन. T¹ sems.dpañ.can 'one with a brave mind', व्युचित. dpañ is here unnecessary, sems.can being quite sufficient as in T². 26.
- „ 3-4 बुधादि°. Ch omits बुधादि and reads समवायसममोहितुप्रत्ययः (*he lid yin yuan*).¹⁰ T² seems to follow it partly and gives a peculiar reading which is not quite clear to me. bdag. ni. rgyu. rlyen. hñus. (in rten. cin. hñiel. bar. sbyor. bañi. byed. pa. po. yin. no 27.
- „ 4-5 आवगः चन्द इति. T¹ dper.ma. me. dro.ba.med. cas.pa.lta. buñ = वया अग्निरुष्ण इति. It has already been noted (Note 20, 2.16-17 above) that the last पञ्चमास in T¹ is प्रसिद्धिविद् and the illustration given above is quite in accordance with it. Yet, T¹ itself, when it illustrates the term, reads प्रसिद्धसम्बन्ध. It appears that T¹ is perfectly right in reading the last पञ्चमास as प्रसिद्धिविद् and in illustrating it as अग्निरुष्ण, for how can प्रसिद्धसम्बन्ध be a पञ्चमास and be illustrated as चन्दः आवगः as there is nothing here which can make an *appearance* (आभास) of the पञ्च? It is, therefore, evident that there is some confusion in the MSS of both the Skt. and other versions. 28.
3. 5 एव वचनानि. T¹ has singular number, वचनम् (brjod.pa. ni). Ch agrees with Skt. But T² एवं 'thus' (ñdi. skad.du). 29.

3. 5-7 धर्मस्वरूपं प्रतिज्ञादोषः The reading of this sentence differs widely in other versions as noted below. In T¹ there is धर्म-स्वरूपनिराकरणमुद्यमे (chos kyi ran bshin hgog par byed pahi sgo. ste) and not धर्मस्वरूपं मुद्यमे as in Skt. As regards 'निराकरणमुद्यमे' Ch follows Skt. The whole sentence in T¹ runs thus एषा वचना धर्मस्वरूपनिराकरणमुद्यमे, सम्बद्ध साधनकलाभावात् (कलाभाव = वैकल्य) प्रतिज्ञादोषः । The sentence ends here. The original is as follows hdi ruams kyi brjod pa ni. chos kyi ran bshin hgog par byed pahi sgo ste । yan dag sgrub par byed pa hbras bu med pahi phyir. dam. bcab bahu. skyon. ruams so ॥ 'मुद्यमे' in निराकरणमुद्यमे and वैकल्यत्वं in साधनवैकल्यत्वं. in Skt are supported by Ch. The sentence in Ch ends in पक्षानाशो दोषः as in T¹ in प्रतिज्ञादोषः, the former reading पक्षानाश-दोष instead of प्रतिज्ञादोष as in Skt and T¹. The Chinese version of the sentence in question may be translated thus १३. यानि वचनानि धर्मस्वरूपनिराकरणमुद्यमे प्रतिषेधकमावात् साधनवैकल्यत्वाच्च पक्षानाश-दोषः ॥ T² is here explanatory and runs as follows hdi. skad du । du mar brjod pa dag no bo bsal bahu phyir dan । sgrub tu dgos pahi phyir dan । sgrub par nus kyan hbras bu med pahi phyir bsgrub byahu skyon yin pas ltar snan no ॥ It may be translated thus एष नानावचने स्वरूपनिराकरणं अतिद्वययोजनाच्च सिद्धिस्तत्रापि कलाभावात् (वैकल्यत्वं) सम्बन्धोपेक्ष सामासः । 30

- ॥ 6 प्रतिज्ञादोषः Ch T² omit प्रतिज्ञा See note on 3 5-7 above. 31
- ॥ 7 वता पक्षानाशः This is not in T¹ while T² reads साध्याभावादिदोषो निश्चितः (bsgrub bya ltar snan bstan zin no ॥) 32
- ॥ 9 अन्वयसिद्धिः T¹ *ist* यद्गोम्यासिद्धिः (gan yan run ba la ma grub pa), T² *ist* यद्येवमसिद्धिः (gan run gcig la ma grub pa), Ch एवमसिद्धिः ॥ 33
- ॥ 14 15 आक्षेपसत्त्वविषयं प्रति T¹ आकाशसत्त्वत्वादिना प्रति (nam mkhah yod - pa nid du brjod pa la) which is wrong The Tibetan reading must be *med pa nid* instead of *yod pa nid* 34 35
- ॥ 16 सांस्कृतिकेति Before कृति the word दस (yul) is omitted in T¹ and T² 36
- ॥ 20 किं पदम्? After पद T¹ T² Ch add आदि (Tib. *la sog*, Ch *ling*¹³) 37

T¹ reads here यथा यटादिवन् प्रमेयत्वाद् नित्य इति (ji ltar bum pa la sogs pa bshin gshal bya ſid kyī phyir. rtag-ces pa lta buho) and omits altogether अन्व आहोस्वित्° नित्य इति । 38-39

3 22 अथाधारण . T¹ T² Ch add अन्व after this 40

4 1 अन्वयवासम्भवात् . T¹ T² Ch °स्वाभावात् 41

11 2 विष्णुत्तरास्य धारणत्वम् T¹ धारणत्वमिदं कथं सत्यहेतुरिति (māñan bya ſid hdi ji ltar na the tshom gyi rgyu ſid do shes paho). T² अनेन हेतुना गभीरं सत्यो भवति (gtan tshigs hdis the tshom zab bar hgyur ro) Ch appears to follow Skt. 42.

11 3 T² omits यथा (dper na) 43

11 4 अप्रयत्नान्तरीयक T¹ अप्रयत्नोत्पन्न (rtsal bas byun ba ma yan. te) 44

11 4 8 अप्रयत्नान्तरीयक पञ्च° अनेकान्तिङ्गम् T¹ अस्य विषय प्रयत्नोत्पन्न, विद्युदाकाशदि सृष्ट्य ॥ तत्रैकदेशविद्युत्पन्नोऽनित्यत्वत्वात् ॥ अक्षराद्यदौ ॥ अक्षर सत्यं प्रयत्नान्तरेण विषयः यटादि । तत्र सर्वत्र अनित्यत्वं विद्यते । एतदपि विद्युत्पटादिषामर्थेण अनेकान्तिकं (hdihi mi mthun pañ phyogs ni brtsal ba las byun baho ॥ glog dan nam mkhah la sogs pa ni mthun phyogs so ॥ de la yul gcig glog la sogs pa la mi rtag pa ſid yod la nam mkhah la sogs pa la med kyī hdihi mthun phyogs rtsal ma byun dan mi mthun phyogs bum pa la sogs paho ॥ de la thams cad la mi rtag pa mid yod la hdihi yan glog dan bum pa chos mthun pañ phyir ma nes paho ॥)

T² अप्रयत्नान्तरीयक व आप्ययमे, तस्य विरोधे यटादौ हेतुव्याप्तम् इति विद्युत्पटादिषामर्थेण अनेकान्तिकम् (brtsal ma thag tu lbyun ba ma yan pa bsgrub byahi chos de mi mthun phyogs bum pa la sogs pa la gtan tshigs khyab par yod la glog dan bum pa la sogs pa mthun chos byas na ma nes pa ste).

Ch reads अप्रयत्नान्तरीयक पक्षोत्पन्न यटादिर्विषयः तत्र सर्वत्र विद्यते ॥ 45-47

11 8 10 विष्णुत्तर° After यट T¹ T² add आदि (la sogs pa) 48

T² altogether omits अहोस्वित्° अत्रान्तरीयकमिति T² reads here अनित्यं व द्वि यटादिवन् प्रयत्नान्तरीयकमेव वा [अनित्यत्वं] विद्युदादिवत् अत्र चान्तरीयकत्वं वा इति आशङ्क After °आध्यात्मिकमिति च Ch appears to have been confused and defective It is not here followed by T² 49

- 4 19 आकाशादौ. T¹ omits आदौ. 56.
- „ „ परमाणौ. T¹ Ch add आदौ reading *rdul.phran.la.sogs.pa.la.* and *chi wei têng*¹⁵ respectively. T², however, follows Skt. 57.
- „ 20 Ch omits अनित्यः पक्षः, while T² retains it. 58.
- „ „ तत्रैकदेशे. T¹ omits only एकदेश, while Ch and T² omit both तत्र and एकदेश. 59.
- „ 21 Ch T² omit. अमूर्तत्वम्. 60.
- „ „ षडदौ. T¹ omits आदि. 61.
5. 1 षडवत्. Ch. T² add आदि (*têng* and *la.sogs pa* respectively). 62.
- „ 2 शब्दस्वरवत्. T¹ शब्दवत्. 63.
- „ 2-3 उभयोः समुदितावेव. T¹ इति विरुद्धार्थयोरेकत्र वृत्तिरुभयोः संशयहेतुरेव । (skes. pa. hgal.bahi. don.dag. gcig.la. yod.pa. ni. gñis.ka.la. the.tshom.gyi. rgyu. ſid. do u). T² तयोस्मयोरनङ्गनस्य-हेतुत्वाद्नैकान्तिकम् (de. gñis.ka.la. the.tshom. za.b.yin.pahi.-phyir. ma.ñes.pa. yin. no u). 64.
- „ 3 चतुर्व्यकार. Ch. T¹ omit प्रकर. 65.
- „ 4-6 धर्मस्वरूपं साधनमिति. Here in these four technical terms Ch and T² read विरुद्ध (Ch. *hsiang wei*;¹⁷ Tib. *hgal.ba*) instead of विपरीत¹⁸ (T¹ *phyin.ci.log*). But, in the fourth term, T² has व्यभिचार (*hkhrul.pa.*). 66.
- „ 5 धर्मिस्वरूपविपरीत¹⁹. T¹ *lit.* धर्मिस्वविपरीत (chos.can.rañ.ldog. dañ). Here in the Tib. version after *rañ* the word *bshin* seems to have been left out. 67.
- „ 5-6 धर्मिविशेषं साधनः. T² धर्मिव्यभिचारविरुद्धहेतुः (chos.can.gyi. hkhrul.pa. dañ. hgal.bahi. gtan.tshigs. so u). 68.
- „ 7 निरवः सार्वः²⁰तीयकत्वाद् वेति. See NB, p. 113: “यथा कृतकत्वं प्रकृत-नन्दरीयकत्वं च निरकत्वे सार्वे विरुद्धो देवमासाः.” T² adds here उक्ते (*brjod. na*). 69.
- „ 8 विरुद्ध एव. T¹ omits एव. 70.
- „ 9-10 परार्थ²¹. This line is entirely found in NB, p. 113. It is called their इष्टविपातवृत्तिरुद्ध । 71.
- „ 9 संपातत्वात्. T² *hñus. qin. bsgas*. 72.
- „ 9 अयनासत्तादि²². T² omits आसन. 73.
- „ 10 अज्ञविशेषकत्वं. T¹ T² Ch with NB omit विशेष. Ch T² omit also अज्ञ before it. 74.
- „ 11 परावृत्तमनः. T¹ T² Ch omit आवृत्तमनः, but see NB, pp. 77-78. 75.
- „ „ संवृत्तमनसि²³ साधयति. The point is very clearly explained in NB, pp. 77-78.

5 17 T omits यक्ष (ji ltar na) 84

11 * " अयमेव हेतुरस्मिन्नव पूर्वपक्षे T² अयमेव पक्ष अस्मिन्नेव पूर्वस्मिन् हेतौ (hdi mid ni phyogs sna mab rtags hdi mid la) Ch follows Slt and it may be translated अयमेव हेतु पूर्वपक्षे T² is defective and omits पक्ष a'together, and appears to mean पुत्रस्मिन् (पक्षे) च एव हेतु 85

11 18 सप्तप्रयवर्तुत्वम् T² सप्तप्रयवर्तुत्वम् (yod pa rkyen gyis byas - pa mid) MS reads byas instead of byed having struck off the latter With byed the phrase would mean सत्त्वं कर्तृत्वम् See note below on 5 19 अक्षत्⁰ 85^a

11 19 अष्टप्रयवर्तुत्वम् T² अष्टप्रयवर्तुत्वम् See note above on 5 18 85^b

11 19 After द्वापयति Ch T² add द्वादिपतिषेचन 86

11 20 Before दद्यात्तामासो Ch adds उत्तो हेतुःप्राप्त (i shuo sau yin),²⁰ while T² reads हेतुप्राप्तोत्तरेन निमित्तम् (gtan tsugs ltar - suan byad zin te i) 87

11 " दद्यात्तामासो द्विविध⁰ T² first reads दद्यात्तामास एवम् (dpe ltar suan ba rnam hdi ltar ste) and then having mentioned all the five kinds of दद्यात्तामास in सप्तम्यं beginning with साधनवर्मासिद्ध (sgrub par byed pah chos ma grub pa dan) and ending in निपरीतात्म (rjes su hgro ba phyin ci log pa an no) it says इति सप्तम्येण (shes pa chos mthun pa mid kyiis so) Then in the same way it begins with चतुर्थम्ये (chos m mthun pa mid la yan) and gives the names of the five kinds of दद्यात्तामास in त्रैपम्ये, साधनान्यास (sgrub par byed pa ldog pa med pa dan) being placed first which comes after साधनान्यास in Slt Ch and T² After this, T² proceeds to explain each of the दद्यात्तामास beginning with सप्त साधनवर्मासिद्धो यथा (de la sgrub par byed pah chos ma sgrub pa ni ji ltar) It is to be noted here that T², unlike Slt Ch and T², does not read the word च (Ch = Tib iia) as the number of either of the two kinds of the दद्यात्तामास

Ch T² are quite in agreement with T² T² has, however, given only the four kinds of its साधनदद्यात्तामास (chos mthun pah dpe ltar suan ba) carelessly leaving out one i e साधनवर्मासिद्ध It has, however, been mentioned and explained later on with the other kinds of साधनदद्यात्तामास For

भनन्वय and विपरीतान्वय T² reads अयोग (? ma sbyar ba) and विपरीतयोग (phyin ci log tu sbyar ba)

In passing it may be observed here that in NB, pp 87 ff and Jam logic (प्रमाणनयतत्त्वाद्धार, बसोविजय जैनग्रन्थमाला, 22, Part I, pp 115 ff) there are nine kinds of रडा तभास both in साधर्म्य and वैषम्ये 88

6 2 3 निरव शब्दो^० परमाशुक्ल T¹ Ch T² omit here परमाशुक्ल 89

„ 4 साधनचर्मोद्भूतं च The reading of T² seems defective It reads here as corrected according to ASB copy sgrub byed kyi chos thogs pa med pa grub pa ste (the original reading being sgrub byed chos grogs sam grub pa ste) which gives no sense Now *sgrub byed kyi chos* is quite clear meaning साधनचर्म and the phrase, *thogs pa med pa* is used in this connection just before a line, and it is evident that it is employed there in the sense of अमूर्तत्व of Skt *lus can ma yin pa mid* of T¹, and *yu chas*²¹ of Ch But the literal meaning of the word *thogs pa* is सङ्ग of *thogs pa med* meaning असङ्ग In NB (Bibliotheca Buddhica, ed Sticherbatski), pp 70, 76 the phrase *thogs pa med* is used for Skt अतिवृद्ध So it appears that it means वृद्ध or पुरातन which is tantamount to मूर्तत्व Thus *thogs pa med pa* means मूर्त or अमूर्त, and the sentence under discussion (1 c *thogs pa med pa grub pa*) may mean मूर्त(व) विधि But as has already been observed that the reading is defective here, I should like to read *thogs pa med pa ma grub pa*, and it may be translated thus (साधनचर्म) अमूर्तविधि 90

„ 4 मूर्तत्वं See NB, pp 94, 116 T² reads throughout *thogs pa med pa* for this See note on 6 4 साधनचर्मो मूर्तत्व above 91

„ 6 बुद्धिर्वा T¹ omits बुद्धिर्वा Ch T² omit निवः चन्दो मूर्तत्वात् Instead of बुद्धि in बुद्धिर्वा T² reads here चन्द and so below 92

„ ११ चन्दनं वसिष्ठे रड यथा बुद्धिः Ch T² omit this 93

„ 10 अतिवृद्धमूर्तत्वं चन्द T² omits चन्द and reads only मूर्तत्वमिति वसिष्ठ Ch T² omit the whole altogether 94

„ 11 वसिष्ठमूर्तत्वं चि T¹ *वाय instead of *वसिष्ठ 95

„ 12 चन्दनचन्दनो Ch T² add here चन्द, 96

„ 12 चन्दनो T¹ चन्दन (rab tu (es par byed pa) 96*

„ 14 चन्दनं वसिष्ठे T² reads वसिष्ठ (thams cad) instead of वसिष्ठ 97.

„ ११ चन्दनं वसिष्ठे Ch T² omit वसिष्ठ, 98

- 6 15 ब्रवीति. Ch adds here एन साधम्येण दृष्ट-ताभासा, while T² reads एते
स(धर्म) दृष्ट-ताभासा (de tnam s ui mthun dpe ltar suan no) lea-
ving out the word धन (chos) after Skt स or Tib mihun 99
- 6 16 पञ्चप्रकार See note 88 100
- „ 18 तत्र साध्याभ्यावृत्तौ यथा See note 88 101
- „ 19 नित्य शब्दोऽमूर्तत्वात् परमाणुवत् T¹ Ch T² omit this 102
- „ 19 20 यदनिव^० परमाणु T¹ omits यदनि- त-मूर्तं दृष्ट यथा परमाणु । Ch T²
follow Skt But as regards T² something is to be noted
The actual reading in the original MS is mi itag pa
nams ni thogs bcas mthon ba yin te rdni phra rab
bshin no । It means अनित्यानि मूर्तानि दृष्टानि परमाणुवत् Thus it
clearly corresponds to both Skt and Ch with a single and
immaterial variation that in T² there is plural number
while in Skt and Ch there is singular But according to
ASB copy, *min te* (न) is written for *yin te* after *mthon ba*
(दृष्ट) which is wrong 103
- „ 20 21 मृतत्वात्तरमागूनम् Ch T² omit this 104
- „ 22 यच्चन भ्यावृत्तौ यथा See note 88 105
- 7 1 कर्मवदिति T¹ omits कर्मवदिति and adds तावत् (re shig) before
कर्मण It also omits °धर्मोऽमूर्तत्वम् in the next line (7 2) Ch
T² put the matter differently 106
- „ 3 उभयाभ्यावृत्त T² has wrongly उभय वावत् (guis la idog pa)
In T¹ after उभयाभ्यावृत्त । आकाशवदिति there is no उत्पत्त्यदिन
प्रति । 107
- „ 5 यत्र विना^० T¹ omits the whole sentence यत्र विना साध्याधन
निवृत्त्या तद्विपक्षभावो निदर्शयै omitting also यथा घटेऽमूर्तत्वम् अनित्यत्वं
च दृष्टमिति, and reads here अन्त्यातिरेको यथा आकाशे नित्यत्वम् अकृतकत्वं
च दृष्टमिति (idog pa med pa in jltar nam mkhah la
rtag pa uid dan i ma byas pa uid kyan mthon shes -
pa lta buho) Then it goes to describe विपरीतव्यतिरेक
(idog pa phyin ei idog pa)
- Ch reads अन्त्यातिरेको यथा घटे अनित्यत्वम् मूर्तत्वं च दृष्ट Mark here
Ch has मूर्तत्वम् (*chik as tsiang*)^{११} and not अमूर्तत्वम् (*an chik as
tsiang*) as in Skt
- T² reads व्यतिरेकदर्शनम् (idog pa bstan pa) instead of अन्त्या-
तिरेक (idog pa med pa) The whole sentence in it mean
व्यतिरेकनिर्दर्शनं यथा घटव्यतिरेके, अनित्यत्वेन मूर्तत्वं च दर्शनात् (idog
pa bstan pa in dper na bum bshin shes bryod na ।

mu rtag pa mthon ba fid dan thogs bcas su mthon
bahi phyr) 108

- 7 79 विपरीतव्यतिरेको यथा T¹ विपरीतव्यतिरेको यथा यन्त्रित्य (तद्) अकृतम् इति
वक्तव्ये यदकृतक तन्त्रित्यम् इदुक्तमिति (ldog pa phyin ci ldog pa ni
jitar gan rtag ste (de) byas pa ma (byas) yin shes
briod par bya ba las gan ma byas pa de rtag pa yin
shes zer ba lta buho : Here (byas) after byas pa ma
seems to have unnecessarily been inserted Cf NB, Tib
(Bibliotheca Indica) p 29 ldog pa phyin ci log ni dper
na gan ma byas pa de mu rtag pa yin no shes bya -
ba lta buho || The original Skt is as follows (NB, p 188)
वैषम्येणापि विपरीतव्यतिरेको यथा यदकृतक तन्त्रित्य भवतीति ।

Ch reads here only विपरीतव्यतिरेको यथा (यन्) मूलं तदन्त्रित्यम्
omitting all the other words in Skt

T² follows Ch saying विपरीतव्यतिरेके प्रयोगो यथा सर्वे पूर्वमन्त्रित्यम्
(ldog pa phyin ci log tu sbyar ba bshun mu thogs bcas
thams cad mu rtag pa yin no :) 109

- „ 10 एवां Ch T² एवम् instead of एवाम् 110

- „ „ एषाहेतुदशतामासानाम् T² साप्त्वं for एषां 111.

- „ 10 11 एवां साधनाभासम् Ch has the whole sentence as follows
एवविधानि पञ्चहेतुदशतामासवचनानि असम्बन्धवचनानि २१ while T² reads
एव साप्त्वंहेतुदशतचनान्यभासा सम्बन्धवचनानि न भवन्ति (de ltar bsgrub
bya dan : gtan tshigs dan : dper briod pa rnam mu
ltar suan ba yin te : sgrub byed an dag ni ma yin
no) 112

- „ 13 प्रयत्नम् T² adds प्रयत्नम् after प्रयत्नम् 113

- „ „ कथनपौद यःशानम् G nerally in Tib कथना is rtog pa as in
T² and not rtogs pa meaning शान etc as used in T². So
it is a unstroke T² adds अत्रा-तम् (ma khrul pa) to कथनपौदम्
as in NB p 103, Tib p 1 This adjective is absolutely
necessary though it is not originally used by Dinnāga
here in the original Skt or in the *Pramanasamuccaya*,
(Tib version) I 3 See NB, quoted above 114

- „ 14 नामजात्यादिद्वयभेदितम् Instead of नामजात्यादिकल्पना T² has व्यवहारा
दिकल्पना (tha suad la sogs pahi rtog pa) T² Ch follow
Skt 115

- 7 15-16 लिङ्ग पुनर्विद्यपसुतम् । T¹ adds चाकूयेन (tshan bar) before उक्तम्,
 • while Ch has यथापुत्रम् (yu chen z)²⁵ and T² reads only
 पूर्वम् (snar) 116 117
- 11 16-17 तस्माद् यदनुमेयेऽर्थे ज्ञानमुत्पद्यते° तदनुमानम् NB, p 104 “त्रिरुपात्तु लिङ्गाद्
 यदनुमेये ज्ञानं तदनुमानम् ।’ 118
- 11 11 In the place of Slt तस्माद् यदनुमेयेऽर्थे° तदनुमानम् T¹ reads वस्माद्
 यदनुमानज्ञानं, ज्ञानम् अत्र नास्ति, माध्यमिकोऽनित्य इत्यादि इदं अनुमानम् (gan
 las gan rjes su dpag pahi ces pa shyes pa hdir med
 dbu ma pa mi rtag ces pa hdi la sogs pa hdi rjes su
 dpag paho ॥) It seems that *rjes su dpag pahi ces pa*
 (अनुमानज्ञानम्) in the above abstract should be taken as
rjes su dpag par bya la ces pa (अनुमेये ज्ञानम्) But *dbu -*
ma pa mi rtag (माध्यमिकोऽनित्य) is curious It appears,
 however, that the words *dbu ma pa* is put here from a
 marginal note The phrase ज्ञानं अत्र नास्ति means that there
 is nothing which is ‘born’ (produced) And this is the
 view of the Mādhyamikas headed by Nagarjuna It is ex-
 plained by him in his *Mādhyamakakārikā* (Bibliotheca
 Buddhica) I, XI, and is supported even by a Brahmanic
 teacher Gaudapada, in his *Larikas* (Ch IV) on the *Mā*
ndukya Upanisad Nagarjuna says (I 1)

न स्वतो नापि परतो न द्वाभ्यां ना बहुभुतः ।

उत्पत्ता ज्ञातु विद्यते भावा क्वचन केचन ॥

The Tib sentence may be punctuated variously, but in
 no case the meaning is clear to me

Ch has तस्माद् यद्विद्ययर्थे सम्यग्ज्ञानमुत्पद्यते, अस्ति अस्तिरनित्यो वा इत्यादि
 तदनुमानम्²⁶ T², too is here not clear to me After reading
 ज्ञानि लिङ्गानि प्रतीत्य अर्थाना मान (?) भावि (de dag rtags la brten
 nas don rnamis dpog pa yin la), it runs an dag pahi
 nes pahi ces pa dan ldan pa dan med yons ces pa
 ham mi rtag par ces pa la sogs pa ste rjes su dpag
 pahi tshad mar brjed do) Instead of सम्यग्ज्ञानम् in Ch it
 has सम्यग्निश्चयज्ञानम् (yan dag pahi nes pahi ces pa) 119

- 11 18 फलमधिगमद्वयत्वात् For अधिगमद्वयत्वात् T¹ reads रूपाद्यधिगमत्वात्
 (gzugs la sogs pa rtogs pa mid kyi phiyir ro) T² reads प्रमाण
 द्वयस्य सम्यग्ज्ञानं प्रमाणकं स्वयंस्मृत्यप्रतीतित्वात् (tshad ma gnis po
 de la an dag pahi ces pa tshad mahu hbras bu yin te)

ran gi nitshau mid rtogs pa! phyir ro)) Ch follows
Skt 120

- 7 18 19 सन्तप्यते इत्येते प्रमाणम् T¹ प्रमाणमपि तत्रैव अभिक्रियासौ सम्प्रदर्शयते
(tshad ma lau de mid de! dou byed nus pa yan dag
par rtogs pahi phyir shes pa o))

T² अभिक्रियासौक्यस्युक्तौ मान्यत्वं प्रमाणमपि मयति (dou byed nus
pahi dnos su gshal ba! phyir te tshad ma han yiu
no)) Ch seems to read स्यात्सर्व एते प्रमाणमपि मयति " 121

- 11 19 20 T² omits अर्थात्तर and reads कर्मानामपि प्रत्यक्षमात्र (itog par
ces pa han munon sum ltar suan no) The literal trans-
lation of कर्मानामपि in T¹ is itog pa dan beas pahi ces pa.
(= कर्तव्य संहित इत्यम्) 122

- 1 20 21 कर्तव्यं यद क^० प्रत्यक्षमात्रम् T¹ has यथा यद कर्मक वा कर्मागच्छति
(ज्ञान) रक्षणविषयज्ञानं प्रत्यक्षमात्रम् (ji ltar ba bun pa han
suan bu shes itog pa dan beas pa de ran gi nitshau
mid kyi yul mid las munon sum ltar suan baho)) Ch
agrees with T¹ excepting that for *suan bu* (कर्मक) in the
latter, the former has *lung*²⁴ (वज्रादि or वज्राणि) T² di-
ffers from them both इति चेष्टादिज्ञान इत्येते तत्प्रत्यक्षमात्रं, तस्मिन्
ज्ञाने अवस्थितकर्तव्यत्वानामासत् (ces pa rnamis kyis bun pa la-
sogs pa rtogs pa shyes pa de munon sum ltar suan yin-
te i ces pa de la dou ran gi nitshau mid su suan bahu
phyir ro!) 123

- 1 21 22 हेत्वभासपूर्वकं ज्ञानमनुमानाभासम् Before ज्ञानम् T¹ adds अग्रतोवाच्यभास^०
(ma rtogs pa dou ltar suan ba!) The whole sen-
tence in Ch seems to mean इत्याभासज्ञानपूर्वकं यदुच्यते अर्थाभासज्ञानं
तदनुमानाभासम् " T² यदि इत्याभासपूर्वकादि तदवर्थाभासज्ञानं जातं तदनुमान-
प्रमाणभासं (gal te gtan tshigs ltar suan suon du sou ba
la sogis deli rjes su dou lta bur suan bahu ces pa shyes-
pa de rjes dpag tshad mal! ltar stag (read suan) ste
Here the sense of जादि (la sogis) is not clear 124

- 8 1 अनुमेयस्यैव ज्ञानम् T¹ reads for it अनुमेया प्रपञ्चानम् (rjes su dpag
par bya ba ltar suan bahu ces pa) T² is defective and
seems to mean पूर्वाचर्य हेत्वभासपूर्वकप्रतिष्ठापनाद् अर्थाभासमानाद् उत्तरं
ज्ञानं तदनुमानप्रमणम् इत्यम् सम्प्रत्यक्षबोधात् (suar brad pa (in the text
b ad pa is repeated twice) bshun du gtan tshigs ltar suan-
du ma rtags su gzun nas i dou lta bur suan ba dpags pa
las shyes pahi ces pa de rnamis rjes su dpag pa tshad -

सर्वभूतप्राणिभ्यः स्वस्ति भवतु ।

The original Tib. of the above runs: *rgya.gar.las. rgyahi.*
lo.tsa.ba. than. san. tsan. gis. bsgyur.cin | slad.kyis.
rgyahi. dge.ces. sen.gyan jus. dan. | bod.gyi. dge.bahi.bces.
gñes. ston. gshon.gyis. bod.skad.du. bsgyur.cin | phyis.
gshi. thams.cad.yod.par.smra.bahi. sde.ba.las. rab tu.
byun.ba. rgya.nag.chen.pohi. lhahl. btsun.pa. choi.kyi.rin.
chen.gyis. | dpal.sa.skyahi. gtsug.lag.khan.du. rgyahi.
dpe. dan | bod.kyi.dpe. gñis.po. legs.par. htugs. (read btus)
cin. bcos.te. dag.par. bsgyur.baho ||

rgyahi. dpe. la. rigs. pa. la. hjug. pa. shes. snan | din.
san. bod.rnams. rigs.pahi.sgo. shes. grags.so ||

hgro.ba. sems.can. thams.cad.la. phan.thogs.par. gyur.
clg. |

- 11 11 अदुष्टान्ते दुष्टान्तदोषवचनम् T¹ अदोषे दृष्टान्ते दृष्टा तदोषवचनम् (slyon med pahū dpe la dpehi slyon brjod pa ste) thus leaving out दुष्ट (slyon can) of दुष्टान्तदोषवचनम् in Skt 135
- 12 12 दृश्यते T¹ slyon med pa ma brjod de : Here the first negation (med) is wrongly put 136
- 13 13 दृष्टुपाभ्यते T¹ इति ताक्त् स्थितम् (shes pa re shig bshag go), T² अर्थोऽयं ताक्त् स्थित (don liti re shig gshag (read bshag). go For स्थित one may read also स्थापित 137
- 14 14 सान्यन युधिचारिता For this in Skt T¹ अन्यस्मात् or अन्यत्र तत् (lit तावि) सुशेवम् (gshan las de dag legs ces bya) T² अवत्र श्रेयम् adding श्रेयस्व (mchog gū gshan du ces par bya) 138
- 15 16 इति° T¹ इति न्याय प्रवेष्टाद्वा महावाच्ये दिङ्नामकृति सङ्गी (shes. pa rigs par ljug pahū sgo slob dpon chen po phyogs - kyi glan pos mdzad pa rdzogs so), T² प्रमाणसाहचर्याय प्रवेष्टो नान महावाच्य दिङ्नामकृति सङ्गी (tshad mahu bstau - bcos rigs pa la ljug pa shes bya ba (slob dpon chen - po phyogs kyi glan pos mdzad pa rdzogs so)) Ch देवु विद्या प्रवेष्टासम्यग्युक्तिशास्त्र 30 139

After this the colophon in T¹ runs as follows
 का रणे र क महापण्डितसवर धी र क्षि ता त् शास्त्र्यभिधु की र्ति च्च ज भी य द्रे ण
 श्री पा ण्ड गु म महाविजरे परिवर्तितम् (kha chehi pandita chen po
 thams cad mkhyen dpal bsrin ba las (dakyahū dge slon
 grags pa rgyal mtshan dpal b'au pos (dpal sa skyahū
 gtsug lag kha chen por bsgyur baho)) Skt परिवर्तितम्,
 Tib bsgyur ba, means 'translated' T² has भा र ते ची न-
 परिवर्तनेन (1 e 'by the Chinese translator') य द्द स द्द च द्द
 (by Than San Tsan = Huan Tsang) परिवर्तितम् । यथा चो ना नां
 प्रमाणं छे द्द य द्द छे द्द (by Sen Gyan Jus) मो दा नां कल्याणभिर्त्रेण
 आघाय कु मा रे ष च भोभाशया परिवर्तितम् । अथ मूलसर्वास्तिवादनायात्
 प्रमत्तेन यदा ची ना नां वेवमन् य य म र ते न श्री पा ण्ड गु मे विहारे चीन-
 भोटगुह्यद्वय सन्ध्याविषय सङ्कल्प शोधनेन परिवर्तितम् ।

चीनगुह्ये न्यायप्रवेष्टा इति दृश्यते । सम्प्रति भोटानां न्यायद्वारम् इति
 प्रतिदम् ।

INDEXES

INDEXES

- () A word or a figure put in a bracket indicates that the word is used only in one text, Sanskrit or Tibetan, as the case may be, and not in both of them
- * An asterisk before a word shows that as regards the derivative or primary meaning there is actually some difference between the words, Sanskrit and Tibetan
- ˆ The letter ˆ upon a figure indicates that the word is used in the paragraph more than once (*repeated*)
- A hyphen before a word signifies that the word is not used in all the cases

The figures refer to the paragraphs which in the Sanskrit text are indicated by small Arabic figures in accordance with the Tibetan text

I

INDEX OF PROPER NAMES

A

Sanskrit-Tibetan

आकाशातस्वरादिन्

nam mkhañ med pa su

da byed pa 27 See 44

बौद्ध

sas :gras 17, 18, 19

(माध्यमिक)

dbu ma pa 56

• वैशेषिक

bye brag pa 15, 19

घण्टाभिन्पक्तिनादिन्

sga mun par gsal bar sgra ba 25

साङ्ख्य

gras can 17, 18

INDEX OF WORDS AND PHRASES

A

Sanskrit-Tibetan.

अकृतक	byas pa. ma. yin. pa 6, 9; byas. pa. med. pa 9.
अग्निसिद्धि	me. sgrub. pa 26.
अक्षमर्थं प्रति	dban. po. so. sohi. dban. po. la 54.
अक्षयव	yan. lag. bshin 37.
अत्र	hdir 9, 56, 65.
अदुष्टद्वान्त	skyon. med. pahi. dpe 64. "
अदुष्टपथ	phyogs. skyon. med. pa 64.
अधिगन्तव्यत्वात्	rtogs. pa. ald. kyī. phyir. ro 57.
अनन्तर्य	rjes. su. hgro. ba. med. pa 41, 45, 47.
अनित्य	mi. rtag. pa. 3, 5 ^r , 8, 10 ^r , 33, 34, 46 ^r .
अनित्यत्वात्	mi. rtag. pa. sid. 9, 31 ^r , 32, 45.
अनित्यत्वात्	mi. rtag. pa. sid. kyī. phyir 31 ^r , 43, 44, 47 ^r .
अनिरथादि	* mi. rtag. pa. (=अनित्य) 6.
अनुमान	rjes. su. dpag. -pa 1, 53, 55, 56.
अनुमानविरोध	rjes. su. dpag. pas. bsal. la 11; rjes. su. dpag. pas. gnod. pa 13.
अनुमानोभास	rjes. su. dpag. ltar. snan 60.
- अनुमेय	rjes. su. dpag. par. bya. ba 60.
(अनुमेयोभासज्ञान)	rjes. su. dpag. par. bya. ba. ltar. snan. bahi. ges. pa 60.
अनेकान्तहेतुक	ma. nes. pahi. rtags 64.
अनेकाधिक	ma. nes. pa 22, 28, 29, 31, 32 ^r , 33, 34, 62.
अन्य	gshan 30.
अन्यतः सिद्ध	gan. yañ. ruñ. ba. la. ma. grub. pa. 23; gañ. ruñ. la. ma. grub. pa.
अन्यत्र	gshan. las 65.
अन्वय	rjes. su. hgro. ba 45.
(अन्वयवचन)	rjes. su. hgro. bar. brjod 10.
अपि	yañ 9 ^r , 9, 11, 31, 34, 37, 39, 47.
अप्रतीत	ma. rtogs. pa 2.
अप्रपञ्चान्तरीयक	*rtsoi. ba. las. byuñ. ba. ma. yin (=अप्रपञ्चान्तरीयक) 31.
अप्रसिद्धविशेषण	khyad. par. rab. tu. grags. pa. ma. yin pa 11, 17. 82.
- अप्रसिद्धविशेषण	khyad. par. can. rab. tu. grags. pa. ma. yin. pa. 11. 18.

III

INDEX OF WORDS AND PHRASES

A

Sanskrit-Tibetan.

अकृतक	byas pa. ma. yin. pa 6, 9; byas, pa. med. pa 9.
अग्निसिद्धि	me. sgrub. pa 26.
अधमर्ष प्रति	dbañ. po. so. soñi. dbañ. po. la 54.
अद्भवत्	yan. lag. bshin 37.
अत्र	hdir 9, 56, 65.
अदुष्टद्वान्त	skyon. med. pañi. dpe 64. "
अदुष्टपथ	phyogs. skyon. med. pa 64.
अधिगमरूपत्वात्	rtogs. pa. ñid. kyi. phyir. ro 57.
अनन्तर्य	rjes. su. hgro. ba. med. pa 41, 45, 47.
अनित्य	mi. rtag. pa. 3, 5*, 8, 10*, 33, 34, 46*.
अनित्यत्व	mi. rtag. pa. ñid. 9, 31*, 32, 45.
अनित्यत्वात्	mi. rtag. pa. ñid. kyi. phyir 31*, 43, 44, 47*.
अनित्यादि	* mi. rtag. pa. (=अनित्य) 6.
अनुमान	rjes. su. dpag. -pa 1, 53, 55, 56.
अनुमानविच्छेद	rjes. su. dpag. pas. bsal. ba 11; rjes. su. dpag. pas. gnod. pa 13.
अनुमानाभास	rjes. su. dpag. ltar. snañ 60.
अनुमेय	rjes. su. dpag. par. bya. ba 60.
(अनुमेयाभासज्ञान)	rjes. su. dpag. par. bya. ba. ltar. snañ. baki. ces. pa 60.
अनेकान्तहेतुक	ma. nes. pañi rtags 64.
अवैकाग्र्य	ma. nes. pa 22, 28, 29, 31, 32*, 33, 34, 62.
अन्य	gshan 30.
अन्यतरासिद्ध	gañ. yañ. ruñ. ba. la. ma. grub. pa. 23; gañ. ruñ. la. ma. grub. pa.
अन्यत्र	gshan. las 65.
अन्वय	rjes. su. hgro. ba 45.
(अन्वयवचन)	rjes. su. hgro. bar. brjod 10.
अपि	yañ 9*, 9, 11, 31, 34, 37, 39, 47.
अप्रतीत	ma. rtogs. pa 2.
अप्यशान्तरीयक	*rtsol. ba. las. byuñ. ba. ma. yin (=अप्यशान्तरीयक) 31.
अप्रतिद्विदेषण	khyad. par. rab. tu. grags. pa. ma. yin pa 11, 17. 32.
अप्रतिद्विदेष्य	khyad. par. can. rab. tu. grags. pa. ma. yin. pa. 11. 18.

अप्रसिद्धोभय

अभाव

अभ्युदय

अभ्युद

अभ्युद

अभ्युद

अभ्युद

अभ्युद

अभ्युद

अभ्युद

अभ्युद

अभ्युद

अभ्युद

अभ्युद

अभ्युद

अभ्युद

अभ्युद

अभ्युद

अभ्युद

अभ्युद

अभ्युद

अभ्युद

अभ्युद

अभ्युद

अभ्युद

अभ्युद

अभ्युद

अभ्युद

अभ्युद

अभ्युद

अभ्युद

अभ्युद

अभ्युद

अभ्युद

gñis la rab tu grags pa ma yin pa 11, 19.
med pa 9, *yod (=भाव) 9.

*yod pa ñid (=भाव) 38

mi hgyur ba 64

lus can ma yin pa 42, 43

lus can ma yin pa ñid 33, 42, 43, 48, 49.

lus can ma yin pa ñid kyī phyir, 33 42,
43, 47, 49

hdi 39

hdihi rtags 36 37, 38

mi rigs 65

don 2, 5 54

don mthun ba 55

don gshan 59

yan lag 10 32

guod pa med pa can 3

mi hgal baki rtags 6

ldog pa med pa 47 50

mlhkhral baki phyir ro 38, 39

munan bya ba ma yin 12

med pa 44

med pa 4

* med pa ñid du hñod pa la (=असत्त्वताम प्रति) 44

* med pa :lyen gyis byas pa ñid (=असत्त्व) 39

* med pa phyir (=असत्त्व) 30

thun mon ma yin pa 28, 29

ma grub pa 22, 67

ma grub pa rtags 64

yod 6, 42, 43

yod pa 8

hdi la 39

nam mkhah 6 10 27, 33 49

nam mkhah bshin 9

nam mkhah bshin (29), 44, 49

nam mkhah la sogs pa 31

nam mkhah med pa ñid du byod pa la

la 27
kun brad pa 65

भागवतिरह	yid. ches. pas. bsal. ba 11; yid. ches. pas. gnod. pa. 15.
भातन	bdag 1, 18, 19.
भातनप्रसाधनाथ	bdag. ſid. kyis. rab. tu. rtogs par. bya. bahi. don. la 53.
भादि	la. sog. pa 2, 3, 9, 37.
भाय्यातिह	gahi. ma. grub. pa. 23, 27.
भासन	stan 37.
भातोतिह	29, 31.
रति	4; ces 9; ces. pa 1, 10; ces. pa. ita. bu 3, 17, 20, 29; ita. buho 15, 31; shes 39, 46, 49, 51, 59; shes. pa 6 ^r , 8, 9, 10 ^r 24, 25, 27, 28, 29, 30 ^r , 33, 34, 37, 44 ^r , 45, 34, 58, 64; shes. pa. ita. buho. 3, 12, 14, 16, 18, 19.
राम	ldi 30, 31 ^r , 32 ^r , 33 ^r , 36, 38.
रह	hdod. pa 11.
रिहित	hdod. pa 3.
उह	brjod. pa 56, 60; smras. pa 9, 21.
उप्यते	brjod. pa. yin 9; brjod. do 10.
उज्जान	brjod. pa 61, 63, 64.
उदिरमान	brjod. pa 26.
उपय	37; gñis. ka. la. 38, 39, 57.
उपययमासिह	gñis. kañi. chos. ma. grub. pa. 41, 47.
उभयपत्रैकदेशरति	gñis. kañi. phyogs. cig. gi. yul. la. yod. pa. 28, 33.
उभयाग्याहन	gñis. ka. idog. pa. med. pa 47, 49.
उपयातिह	gñis. ka. la. ma. grub 22, 24, 44 ^r .
उभयोः	gñis. ka. la 34.
उपरम्पते	61.
एह	34.
पहदेह	yul. gelg 31, 33 ^r .
पहम्पवपाव	rdzas. gcig. pa. can. ſid. kyi. phyir 39.
पहान्तेहउह	ma. ſes. pa. med. pah. rtags 64.
एतद्	ldi 10, 21, 31, 52, 64 ^r .
एतदि	ldi. yañ 32, 33.
एत	ſid 1, 6 ^r , 8, 10, 34, 39 ^r , 57; ſid. du 9.
हप्यते	ston. pa 9.
हपाह	thod 11.
हमन्	las 38, 47 ^r .

कश्चनान्न	stog, pa. dan. bcas. pahl. gas. pa 59.
कश्चनान्नोऽ	stog. pa. dan. bral. la 54.
कल्पसारहि	stog. pa. dan. bral. la 54.
पात्र	dus 10.
दिम्	gan 4, 5', 29, 31.
किं पुनः	yan. gas 4.
किंभूय	jl. las 30.
दृक्	byas. pa. 8, 10', 46'.
दृक्का	*byas. pa (=दृक्) 9; byas. pa. śīd 6, 45.
दृक्कात्	byas. pa. śīd. lyl. phylir 10, 25, 34, 36.
गुण	yon. tan 38.
गुणमयं भगवत्	*yon. tan. dā. las lyl. ran. bshin. yin. pahl. phylir (=गुणमयंभगवत्) 38.
गुणभक्त्या	yon. tan. gyl. gshi. śīd. lyl. phylir 27.
पत्र	bum. pa 13, 33, 45, 59.
पत्रम्	bum. pa. bshin (10), 31, 34, 44; *bum pa la. sogs. pa. bshin (=पत्रम्) 29.
पटारि	bum pa. la. so. pa 5, 31, 32', 33.
प	dan 1', 4', 7, 21, 23, 28', 30, 35, 39, 41, 44', 45, 17.
पञ्चरात्रि	mig la sog. pa 37'.
पञ्चमकार	dbye. ba. bshl 22; bshir. dbye 35.
षाड्षपराम्	mig gi. gas. bar. bya. ba. śīd. lyl. phylir. 24.
षेव	*seus dpah. can (=षेव) 18.
जात्यादि	rags. la. sog. pa 51.
ज्ञान	gas. pa. 54, 57, 60.
तद्	de. 3, 8', 9, 10', 42', 43, 46', 51, 54, 57, 59, 63, 65.
तत्र	de. la 2, 3, 6, 8, 12, 22, 24, 29, 31', 32, 33', 36, 42, 44, 54.
तथा	de. lar 37, 38.
तद्धि	de. ni 29, 30
तत्तथा	*hdi lar (=तत्तथा) 5, 9, 10, 11, 22, 35.
वद्विपरीत	dehl. bzlog. pa 39.
वस्मात्	dehl. phylir 32, 33, 56; de. las 60.
वाच्य	8.
वृ	1. *
वि	gsun 10.
विक्रय	tshin. gsun 4, 56

रिद्धात्तसिद्धये	phyogs tsam bsgrebs pahi phyir 65
दुष्टद्वान्तदोष	* dpehi skyon (=द्वान्तदोष) 64
दुपण *	sun hbyin 1 °pa 61, 63
दुपणाभाति	sun lbyin ltar snan ba 61*
दुप्यते	skyon med pa ma brjod 64
दृष्ट	mthon 6, 8, 10* 42, 43, 45, 46
द्वान्त	dpe 2, 7
द्वान्तदोष	dpehi skyon 62
द्वान्ताभास	dpe ltar snan ba rnams 41, 49, 52
द्रव्य	rdzas 27 38
द्रव्यादिप्रतिषेध	rdzas la sogs pahi ma yin pa 38
द्विविध	gñis su dbye 7, 44
द्वे एव प्रमाणे	tshad ma fñid dag go 53
द्वि	34
धर्मविशेष	chos kyī khyad pa 35
धर्मविशेषविपरीतसाधन	chos kyī khyad par phyin ci log tu sgrub par byed pa 35
धर्मस्वरूप	chos kyī ran bshin 21, 35
धर्मस्वरूपविपरीतसाधन	chos kyī ran bshin phyin ci log tu sgrub par byed pa 36
धर्मिन्	chos can 3 39
धर्मिविशेष	chos can gyī kyad pa 35
धर्मिविशेषविपरीतसाधन	chos can gyī kyad par phyin ci log tu sgrub par byed pa 39
धर्मिस्वरूप	chos can gyī ran bshin 35
धर्मिस्वरूपविपरीतसाधन	chos can ran bshin phyin ci log tu sgrub par byed pa 38
न	med 31 32 33 38*, 47, 48 49
नरशिरः कपाट	mihi mgo thod 14
नाकाक्षारी	nam mkhah la sogs pa la med pa 32
नाशन्	min 54
नास्ति	med pa 6*, 42 °de 43
नित्य	rtag pa 6 9, 10, 13 15 29*, 30, 33*, 34, 36, 42, 43*
नित्यतत्	rtag pa mid 42 43, 47*, 48 49
नित्यतत्ताव	rtag pa mid kyi phyir 48, 49.
नित्यानित्यविनिर्मुक्त	rtag mi rtag gi rnams par nes pa spans pa

निरुपनिषत्पत्र	r ag mī rtag gi phyogs 29, 30
निरुपनिषत्पत्र	shyon med pa n d lyi phyir 64
निरुपनिषत्पत्र	l zog par byed pahl sgo 21
(नमः)	nes pa 6
नृत्त	* tsa tshan (नृत्य) 67
नृत्तचरन	ma tshan ba n d brjod pa 64
पद्य	phyogs 2 3 9 3 1, 33 39 52
पञ्चाक्षर	phyogs lyi shyon 62
पञ्चाक्षरचरन	phyogs lyi shyon brjod pa 64
पञ्चमस्त	phyogs kyī choa n d 4
पञ्चमस्तचरन	phyogs kyī choa brjod pa 10
पञ्चमस्त	phyogs brjod pa 10
पञ्चाभास	phyogs ltar sman ba 11 (21)
पट	59
पराधमत्व	ish g don cun zad 65
पर	gshan l 10 37
परपत्र	gshan gyi phyogs 64
परमाद्य	rdul phran 3, 48
परमाद्युक्त	rdul phran rab bsh n 47 48
परमाद्युक्त नृत्तचरन	rdul phran rnamz las. can. uld yin pahl phyir ro 42
परमाद्युक्त	rdul phran la sogs pa 33
पराध	gshan gyi don 37
पराध	gshan gyi don n d 37
उत्तर	yan 4 5 55
उत्तर	sas ma 59
उत्तर	sas ma bshin 57
प्राप्तद्वयार्थ	sas can gyi yan lag yin pahl phyir 14
प्रतिष्ठापन	dam bsal bab shyon 21
प्रतिष्ठापनसम्भवत	* yan dag par rab tu rtogs pa med pahl phyir (सम्भवप्रतिष्ठापनार्थ) 21
प्रतिष्ठापन इति	rab tu rtogs par byed pahl phyir ro shes palo 2
प्राप्त	manon sum l 3 53 54
प्राप्तविरुद्ध	manon sum gyis bsal ba 11 manon sum gyis gnod pa 12
प्राप्तविरुद्ध	manon sum la ogs pas bsal 11

प्रत्यक्षादिविद्वत्त्व

प्रत्यक्षामात्र

प्रत्यायन^{*}

प्रदर्शयते

प्रमाण

प्रमाणत्व

प्रमत्तत्वात्

प्रयत्नान्तरीयक

प्रयत्नान्तरीयकत्व

प्रयत्नान्तरीयकत्वात्

(प्रयत्नोत्पत्तिः)

प्रसिद्ध

प्रसिद्धसम्बन्ध

प्राधिक

प्राधिकप्रत्यायन

फल

बहुमकार

वाध्यादिभाव

बुद्धि

बुद्धिवत्

बुद्ध

बौद्धं प्रति

ब्रवीति

(भवति)

भाव

भावाभाव

भूतवद्भाव

मातृ

मूर्तत्व

मे

यथा

यद्

यश्च

यकि

* mñon. sum. la. sogs. pa. gnod (=विद्वत्) 62.

mñon. sum. ltār. snañ. ba 59.

rtogs. pa 10.

* rab. tu. ces. par. byed. pa (=प्रमायते) 45.

tshd. wa 53.

58.

gshal. bya. ñid. kyi. phyir 29^r.* rtol. ba. las. byuu. ba (=प्रयत्नोत्पत्तिः) 32^r.

* btsal. ma. thag. tu. byuu. ba (=प्रयत्नान्तरीयक) 6.

btsal. ma. thag. tu. byuu. ba. ñid. kyi. phyir 36.

tsal. ma. byuu. 31.

rab. tu. grags. pa 3^r.

rab. tu. grags. pa. dan. hbrel (11), 20.

phyir. rgol. 2 63.

phyir. rgol. gyis. rab. tu. rtogs. pa 63.

hbtras. bu 57.

dōye. ña. man. po 60

rlans. pa. la. sogs. pahñ dños. po 26.

blo 43^r

blo. bshin 43.

sans. rgyas 17.

saus. rgyas. pa. la 18, 19.

zer. ba 46, 51.

yin 10^r.dnos. -po 38^r.

yod. dan. med 9.

hbyun. ña. hdus. pa 26.

ma. mo 16.

lus. can. ñid 44 48.

nahñ 16.

3, dper. na 6, 8^r, 9^r, 10^r 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17,

18, 19, 20, 31, 39, 42, 43, ji. ltar. -na 9, 32, 33,

34, 36, 37^r, 38^r, 42, 45, 51; * hñi. ltar (=पत्न्य)

43

gaw 6, 8, 9, 10^r 39, 42, 43, 46^r, 51^r, 54, 56, 59, 65.

gaw. la. 6, 8, 9, 45.

rigs 65.

रुपादि

रुपादी अर्थ

जिङ्ग

छोतविपद्

वचन

वचन

वन्ध्या

वर्तते

वा

वाक्ययेप

विषये

वियमान

विपुलाकाशदि

विपुलादि

विपुलदृष्टापन्मैत्र

विना

विनाशिन

विषय

विषय एव भावत्

मित्र-यापिन

विषयैर्हृदयदृष्टि

विपरीत-व्यतिरेक

विपरीतसाधन

विपरीतान्वय

विषय

विषयद्वेष्टक

विषयान्वयविचारित

विशिष्टता

विशेष

वेषमयं

वैशेषिक

व्यतिरेकवचन

व्यतिरेकविपरीत

gzugs. la. sogs 54.

gzugs. la. sogs. don. la 54.

rtags 55, 56.

hjug. sten. gyis. guod. pa 14; hjug. sten. pas.

bsal ba 11.

brjod par. bya. ba 46.

brjod. pa 2', 10, 21, 52, 64'.

gcam 16

yod pa 54.

ham 6, 36, 59; Lyan 65.

3.

yod. la 31, 33'.

yod. pa 44.

glog. dau nau mkhah. la. sogs. pa 31, 32.

glog la. sogs. pa 31, 32.

* glog. dau buu. pa. chos mthun. pah. phyar
(=सप्तमैत्र) 31, 32'.

med. pas 45.

hjig 17.

mi. mthun phyogs 4, 6', 31', 32, 33.

mi. mthun phyogs. kho na la. yod pas 36.

mi. mthun. phyogs la. lhyab. pa 28, 31'.

mi. mthun. phyogs lya. phyogs. geig. gi. yul.

la. yod 28, mi mthun. phyogs. lya. yul.

geig. la yod 32

ldog. pa phyin ci. log. pa 51

phyin ci. log tu sgrub. par. byed. pa 35'.

rjes su. hgro ba phyin ci. log pa 40, 46.

bsal. ba 11', hgal ba 22, 35, 36, 62.

hgal ba. rtags 64.

hgal ba. la. mi. hkhru. ba 28, 34.

* lhyad par. du. byas. pa 3.

lhyad pa 3, 39.

* chos. mi. mthun pa (=विषय) 7, 9, 47; °hid 40,
41.

bye. brag. pa 15, 19.

bzlog. pa brjod pa 10

ldog. pa. phyin. ci. ldog. pa. 47.

ध्यातृषु	ldog-pa 47, 48 ^r , 49 ^r , 50.
ध्यातृत्वत्वात्	ldog. pa. ñid. kyi. phyir 30.
शब्द	dun 14.
शब्दशक्तिवत्	dun. ñan. ña. phyis. shes. pa bshin 14.
शब्द	sgra 3, 5, 9, 10, 12, 15, 17, 29, 31, 32, 33, 34, 36, 42, 43.
शब्दत्ववत्	* sgra. bshin. (—शब्दवत्) 34.
शब्दानिरूप्य	sgra. mi. rtag. ñid 24.
शब्दाभिप्रेत्यक्तिवादिनं प्रति	sgra. maon par. gsal. bar. sgra. ba. la. 25.
शायन	mal. cha 37.
शाय	bstan. bcas 1.
शिरसि	mgo 14.
शुक्ति	ña. phyis 14.
शुचि	gtsan 14.
श्रावणः शब्दः	(sgra. mñan. bya. yin no) 20.
श्रावणरथ	mñan. bya. ñid 30.
श्रावणत्वाद्	mñan. bya. ñid. kyi. phyir 30, 34.
षट्षकार	drag du. dbye 28.
संविदे	rtogs. phyir 1; rig. phyir 1.
संशयदेष्टु	the. tshom. gyi. rgyu 30.
संशयदेतुत्व	the. tshom. gyi. rgyu. ñid 34.
संशय	bsadus. pa 1.
संशयतृ	hdus. pa. ñid 37 ^r .
सद्य	yod. pa 44.
सद्य	yod. pa 4.
सत्यप्रत्ययकर्तृत्व	yod. pa. rkyen. gyis byed. pa. ñid 39.
सन्दिग्धासिद्ध	the. tshom. za. nas. ma. grub. pa 23, 26.
संदिग्धान	the. tshom. za. ba 26.
सपथ	mtshun. pah. phyog 4, 5 ^r , 8, mtshun. phyogs 5, 10, 31 ^r , 32, 33 ^r .
सपथस्यापि	mtshun. phyogs. la. khyab. pa 28, 32.
सपथैकदेशदृष्टि	mtshun. phyogs. kyi. phyogs. gcig. la. yod 28; mtshun. phyogs. kyi. phyogs. cig. gi. yul. la. yod 31.
सनयाधिकारण	hdu. bar. byed. pa. can 19.
सनान	mtshuns. pa 5.

सद्यस्ते	* slyes pa (=सद्यस्ते) 39.
सद्यस्ते	34.
सद्यस्ते	you. dag. par. lshan. ba 64.
सद्यस्ते	thams. cad. la 31, 32.
सद्यस्ते	53.
सद्यस्ते	lhan. cig. yod. pa 45.
सद्यस्ते	grabs cau. pa 18.
सद्यस्ते प्रति	grabs. cau. pa la 17.
सद्यस्ते	sgrub. pa 1; sgrub. par. byed. pa 2, 10, 47', 49, 64.
सद्यस्ते	sgrub. par. byed. pah. skyos. 61, 62, 64.
सद्यस्ते	sgrub. par. byed. pah. chos 42, 43.
सद्यस्ते	62.
सद्यस्ते	sgrub. par. byed. pah. chos. ma. grub. pa 41, 42, 47.
सद्यस्ते	sgrub. par. byed pa. kbras. ba med. pah.
सद्यस्ते	ghyir 21.
सद्यस्ते	sgrub. par. byed par. lhar. snan ba 52.
सद्यस्ते	sgrub par. byed. pa. ldog. pa. med. pa 47'.
सद्यस्ते	sgrub. par. byed pa 37'; sgrub. par. byed. pa. yin. te 39.
सद्यस्ते	bsgrub par. bya. bar 11.
सद्यस्ते	* chos. mthun pa (=चोस्ते) 7, 8; chos. mthun. pa, lid 40, 41.
सद्यस्ते	thun. moa. ba 28, 29.
सद्यस्ते	thun. moa. ba. lid 29.
सद्यस्ते	bsgrub. par. bya. ba 6, 42, 43; bsgrub. bya. 47'.
सद्यस्ते	* sgrub. bya. lko. nar (=सद्यस्ते) 3.
सद्यस्ते	bsgrub. par. bya. chos 5, 43
सद्यस्ते	bsgrub. par. bya. bahl. chos ma. grub. pa 41, 43, 47.
सद्यस्ते	bsgrub. par. bya. ba. dan. sgrub par. byed. pa. dag 45.
सद्यस्ते	bsgrub par. bya. ba med. pa 9.
सद्यस्ते	sgrub. par. bya. ba. ldog. pa. med pa. 47, 48.
सद्यस्ते	lhar. snan bcas pa 1.
सद्यस्ते	spyi 5.

सामान्यविशेषवत्	spyi dan khyad par bshun 38
सिद्धहेतुक	grub pahi rtags 64
स	legs 65
सुखाकाशादिसाधर्म्येण	* bde ba dan nam mkhah chos mthun pahi dper byas pa ūid kyas (=सुखाकाशाधर्म्यदृष्टान्तेन) 33
सन्नादि	bde ba la. sog. pa 19, 33'
सुविचारिता	65
स्वयम्	ran gas 3
स्वच्छणविषयत्वात्	ran gi mtshan ūid kyi yul ūid las 59,
स्ववचनविरुद्ध	ran gi tshig gas bsal ba 11' ran gi tshig gis guod pa 16
हि	ni 1, 2, 38
हेतु	rtags 9, 38, 39 glan tshigs 2 4, 6 8, 52
हेतुरोप	rtags kyi shyon 62
हेत्वाभास	rtags ltar suan 60, gtau tshigs ltar suan ba 22
हेत्वाभासपूर्वक	suar gyi rtags ltar suan 60

B Tibetan-Sanskrit

lun bṣad pa	आख्यात 65
lyan	अवि 9, 37 ^r , (45) (50)
skyes pa	(गान) 56, समुदायो (for समुदाय) 59
skyon med pa ſiḍ kyī phyir	निश्चयत्वात् 64
skyon med pa ma bṛjod	दूरीते 64
skyon med pahi dpe la	अदृष्टशब्दे 64
khyad pa	विशेष 3 39
khyad par can rab tu grags pa ma yin pa	अप्रतिद्विषेय 11, 18
khyad par du byas pa	* विविधता 8
khyad par rab tu grags pa ma yin pa	अप्रतिद्विषेय 11, 17
gan	किम् 4, 5, यत् 6 8, 9, 10 ^r 39 42 43, 46 ^r , 51 ^r , 51, 56 59, 65
gan yan run ba la ma grub pa	अ यत्तत्सिद्ध 23
gan run la ma grub pa	,, 25
gan la	यत् 6 8 9, 45
gan las	(यत्मात्) 56
grags pas bsal ba	(प्रतिद्विषद्) 11
grags can pa	संख्य 18
grags can pa la	साख्य प्रति 17
grub pahi rtags la	सिद्धहेतुके 64
glog dan nam mkhah la sogs pa	विशुद्धाकाशारि 31 32
glog dan bum pa chos mthun pahi phyir	*विशुद्धसाधर्म्येण (for °साधर्म्येण) 31
glog la sogs	विशुद्धारि 31, 32
ngo	सिरस्य 14
ngal ba	विरुद्ध 27, 35 36 62
ngal bahl rtags nid	(विरुद्धहेतुत्व) 62
ngal bahl rtags	विरुद्धहेतुक 64
ngal bahl don dag gong la yod pa ni	(विरुद्धार्थपरिकल्प इति,) 34
ngal ba la ni hkhruḷ ba	विरुद्धान्यभिचारिन् 28 34

h'gog par byed pañ sgo
 r'gol
 s'gra

 s'gra unon par gsal bar s'gra ba la
 s'gra mi rtag ñid
 s'gra bshin
 s'grub pa
 s'grub pa la
 s'grub par bya ba ldog pa med pa
 s'grub par byed pa

 s'grub par byed pañ s'lyon
 s'grub par byed pañ chos
 s'grub par byed pañ chos na grub pa
 s'grub par byed pa 'oras bu med pañ
 phyir
 s'grub par byed pa yin te
 s'grub par byed par ltar snan ba
 s'grub par byed pa ldog pa med pa
 s'grub bya kho nar
 bs'grub pa
 bs'grub par bya ba
 bs'grub par bya ba d'u s'grub par
 byed pa dag
 bs'grub par bya ba med pa
 bs'grub par bya bali chos
 bs'grub par bya bali chos ma grub pa
 bs'grub par bya bar
 bs'grub par bya ba ldog pa med pa
 bs'grub bya
 bs'grub byañ chos
 bs'grub byañ chos na grub pa
 bs'grub byañ chos la sogs pa ma grub pa
 uñu
 nes pa

निराकरणकुल 21
 प्राप्ति 63
 शब्द 3 5, 9, 10, 12 15, 17
 29 31, 32, 33, 34, 36, 42
 43
 शब्दाभिव्यक्तिमादिन प्रति 25
 शब्दानित्यत्व 24
 *शब्दस्वरूप (for शब्दस्वरूप) 34
 साधन 1
 *साधने (for साधने) 24
 साध्याव्याप्ति 41 47
 साधन 2, 10, 17 48 64,
 साधपति 37
 साधनशेष 61 62, 64
 साधनवर्ग 42, 48
 साधनवर्गसिद्धि 41 42 47

 साधनवैकल्य 21
 साधपति 39
 साधनाभाव 52
 साधनाव्याप्ति 41 47
 *साधपत्ने (for साधप एव) 3
 *साध्य (for साधन) 5
 साध्य 42, 48

 साध्यसाधन 45
 साध्याभाव 9
 साध्यधर्म 5
 साध्यावर्गसिद्धि 41 42
 साधपति 11
 साध्याव्याप्ति 48
 साध्य 47
 साध्यधर्म 43
 साध्यधर्मसिद्धि 43
 (साध्यधर्मसिद्धि) 62
 मे 16
 (निश्चय) 4

dnos po	भाव 38 ^r
dnos pa yin po	भाव 38
maon sum	प्रत्यय 13, 53, 51 ^r
maon sum gyis bsal ba	प्रत्ययविच्छेद 11
maon sum gyis gnod pa	प्रत्ययविच्छेद 12
maon sum liar snau ba	प्रत्ययाभास 59
maon sum la sogz pa gnod	*प्रत्ययादिविच्छेदस्य (for °च्छेद) 62
maon sum la sogz pas bsal	प्रत्ययादिविच्छेद 11
saa ma	पूर्वं 39
saa ma bshin	पूर्ववत् 32
saa gyi riags liar snan	हेत्वाभासपूर्वक 60
ces	इति 9
ces bsgrub pa	इति साधयति 15
ces pa	इति 1 10
ces paho	(29) इति 30
ces pa lta buho	इति 3, 13, 17, 20 29
cun zad	(किञ्चिन्-मात्रम्) 65
chos kyi khyad pa	धर्मविशेष 35
chos kyi khyad par phyin ci log tu sgrub	धर्मविशेषविपरीतसाधन 37
par byed pa	धर्मस्वरूप 21 35
chos kyi ran bshin	धर्मस्वरूपविपरीतसाधन 36
chos kyi ran bshin phyin ci log tu sgrub	धर्मिन् 3 39
par byed pa	धर्मविशेष 35
chos can	धर्मविशेषविपरीतसाधन 39
chos can gyi khyad par	धर्मस्वरूप 35
chos can gyi khyad par phyin ci tu log	धर्मिन्विशेषविपरीतसाधन 39
tu sgrub par byed pa	धर्मस्वरूप 35
chos can ran bshin	धर्मिन्विशेषविपरीतसाधन 39
chos can ran bshin phyin ci log tu	धर्मस्वरूप 35
sgrub par byed pa	धर्मिन्विशेषविपरीतसाधन 38
chos mthun pa	*साधर्म्ये (for सधर्म) 7 8
chos mthun pa űid	साधर्म्य 40
chos mi mthun pa	*वैधर्म्य (for विधर्म) 7, 9
chos mi mthun pa űid	वैधर्म्य 40, 41, 47
ji liar	यथा 9 (29) 32, 33, 34, 36,
	37 ^r 38, 38 42 45 (50)
	विधृतस्य (for विधृत) 30.
	विनाशित् 17
hjiig	

hjiḡ. rten. gyis. guod. pa
 hjiḡ. rten. pas. bsal. ba
 rjes. sñ. hgroḡba. phyin. ci. log. pa
 rjes. su. hgro. ba
 rjes. su. hgro. ba. phyin. ci. log. pa
 rjes. su. hgro. ba. med. pa
 rjes. su. hgro. bar. brjod.
 rjes. su. dpag. ltar. snañ
 rjes. su. dpag.
 rjes. su. dpag. pa
 rjes. su. dpag. pañi ces. pa
 rjes. su. dpag. par bya. ba
 rjes. su. dpag. par. bya. ba. ltar. snañ bañi.
 ces. pa
 rjes. su. dpag. pas. guod. pa
 rjes. su. dpag. pas. bsal. ba
 brjod. do
 brjod. pa

 brjod. pa. yin
 brjod. par. bya. ba
 ñid

 ñid. du
 ñes. pa
 gñis. ka. ldog. pa. med. pa
 gñis. kañi. chos. ma. grub. pa
 gñis. kañi. phyogs. gcig. gi. yul. la. yod. pa
 gñis. ka. rab. tu. grags. pa. ma. yin. pa
 gñis. ka. la
 gñis. ka. ma. grub. pa
 gñis. ka. la. ma. grub. -pa
 gñis. su. dbye
 mñau. bya. ñid
 mñau. bya. ñid. kyl. phyir
 mñau. bya. ba. ma. yin

लौकविह 14.
 „ 11.
 विपरीतान्वय 40, 46.
 अन्वय 45.
 विपरीतान्वय 46.
 अनन्वय 41, 45, 47.
 (अन्वयवचन) 10.
 अनुमानाभास 60.
 अनुमान 1.
 „ 53, 55, 56.
 (अनुमानज्ञान) 56.
 अनुमेय 60.

 (अनुमेयाभासज्ञान) 60
 अनुमानविह 13.
 अनुमानविह 11.
 व्युत्पत्ते 10.
 वचन 2, 10 21, 52, 61; उपदि-
 श्यमाने 26; उक्त 56, 60;
 उद्गातव्य 61, 63, 64.
 व्युत्पत्ते 9.
 वक्तव्य 46.
 एव 1, (4), (5), 6, 8, 10, 29,
 57, (58).
 एव (4), 9.
 (वचन) 6.
 उभयाप्याहत 41, 49.
 उभयपक्षान्ति 41, 47.
 उभयपक्षैर्द्वैच्यति 28, 33.
 अत्रचिद्वैच्य 11, 10.
 उभयोः 34; उभयत्र 38, 39, 57.
 उभयान्ति 44'.
 उभयान्ति 22, 24.
 द्विविध 7, 41.
 भावजनक 30.
 भावजनकार 30, 31.
 भावजन 12.

te	5, 9, 20, 34 ^r
glañ	यचि 14
glañ tshigs	हेतु 2, 4 6, 8 52
glañ tshigs ltar snan ba	हेत्वाभास 22
rtag pa	निरत्य 9, 10, 13, 15, 29 ^r , 30 33 ^r , 34, 36, 42 ^r , 43 ^r , (51 ^r)
rtag pa mid	निरत्यत् 42, 43, 47 ^r , 48, 49, (50)
rtag pa mid lyi phyir ro	निरत्यत्त्वात् 48, 49
rtag pañ sgra	निरत्यम्ब 9
rtag pa yin pa	निरत्य 6
rtag mi rtag gi rnaam par nes pa spaas pa	नित्यानिरत्यविनिर्मुक्त 30
rtag mi rtag gi phyogs	निरत्यानिरत्यपञ्च 29, 30
rtags	हेतु 9, 38, 39, छिद्र 55 66
rtags lyi skyon	हेतुरोप 62
rtags ltar snan	हेत्वाभास 60
rtog pa dan bcas ces pa	कल्पनाज्ञान 59
rtog pa dan bral ba	कल्पनारहित 54, कल्पनापोद 54
rtogs pa	प्रत्यायन 10 (प्रतीति) 58
rtogs pañ dus	*प्रत्यायन (for प्रत्यायनकार) 63
rtogs phyir	सविदे 1
rtogs pañ phyir	(प्रतीति) 58
lta bu	(इव) 26, इति 15 31, (46), (50)
ltar snan bcas pa	साभास 1
stan	आसन 37 ^r
ste	2 3, 6 7, 8 ^r , 9, 10 ^r , 21, 23, 29, 36, 44 ^r
ston pa	*वक्ष्यते (for दक्ष्यते) 9
bstan bcas	शब्द 1
thams can la	सर्वत्र 31 32
the tshom gyi rgyu	सद्यदेतु 30
the tshom gyi rgyu ñid	सद्यदेतुत्वं 34
the tshom za nas ma grub pa	सदिग्धासिद्ध 23, 26
the tshom za. ba	सदिग्धमान 26
thun mon	साधारण 28, 29
thun mon ba ñid lyi phyir	साधारणत्वात् 29

thun, mon, ma, yin, pa	असाधारण 28, 29.
thod	कपाळ 14.
nthun, pañi, phyogs	सपथ 4, 5 ^r , 8.
nthun, phyogs	सपथ 5, (10), 31 ^r , 32, 33 ^r .
nthun, phyogs, kyī, phyogs cig, gi-yul, la, yod	सपथैकदेशवृत्ति 21.
nthun, phyogs, kyī, phyogs geig, la, yod	,, 28.
nthun, phyogs, la, khyab, pa	सपथव्यवधि 28, 32.
nthon	ष्ट 6, 8, 10 ^r , 42, 43, 45, 46 ^r , (50).
dan	च 1 ^r , 2, 4 ^r , (6), 7, 9, 21, 23 ^r 28, 30, 35 ^r , (37 ^r), 38 ^r , 39, 41, 44 ^r , 45, 47 ^r , (50) (62 ^r).
dam	वा 6.
dam, bcañ, bañi, skyon	प्रतिशब्दोप 21.
dan, dan, ka, phyis, shes, pa, bshin	सङ्घटितवत् 14.
dus	काळ 10.
de	तद् 4, (5), 8, 9, 10 ^r , 38, 42, 43, 45 ^r , 51, 54, 57, 63, 65.
de, ltar	तथा 27, 38.
de, ni	तदि 29, 30.
deñi, phyir	तस्माद् 32, 33.
deñi, bzlog, pa	तद्विपरीत 39.
de, la	तत्र 2, 3, 8, 12, 22, 24, 29, 31 ^r , 32 ^r , 38, 36, 42 ^r , 44, 54.
de, las	तस्मात् 60.
don	अथे 2, 5, 54.
don, mthoñ, ba	अर्थश्च 55.
don, byed, nus, pa	(अर्थक्रियावृत्ति) 58.
don, gshan,	अर्थान्तर 59.
drug, du, dbye	पदप्रकार 28.
dro, ba, med,	(अवृत्त्य) 20.
bdag	आत्मन् 1, 18, 19.
bdag, nid, kyis, rab, tu, rtogs, par, bya, bañi, don	आत्मप्रदायनार्थ 53.
bde, ba, dañ, nam, mkhañ, chos, mthun, pañi,	
dper, byas, pa, nid, kyis	*सप्तकाव्यादितापम्येण (for सप्त- काव्यतापम्येण) 33.

te	5, 9, 20, 34 ^r .
g ^{tan}	घृत्ति 14.
g ^{tan} . tshigs	हेतु 2, 4, 6, 8, 52.
g ^{tan} . tshigs. l ^{tar} . s ^{nau} . ba	हेत्वाभास 22.
r ^{tag} . pa	नित्य 9, 10, 13, 15, 29 ^r , 30, 33 ^r , 34, 36, 42 ^r , 43 ^r , (51 ^r).
r ^{tag} . pa. ſid	निरपत्त्य 42, 43, 47 ^r , 48, 49, (50).
r ^{tag} . pa. ſid. k ^{yi} . p ^{hyir} . to	नित्यत्वाद् 48, 49.
r ^{tag} . p ^{ahi} . s ^{gra}	नित्यघट् 9.
r ^{tag} . pa. yin. pa	नित्य 5.
r ^{tag} . m ⁱ . r ^{tag} . g ⁱ . r ^{nam} . par. nes. pa. s ^{pas} pa	नित्यनित्यविनिर्मुक्त 30.
r ^{tag} . m ⁱ . r ^{tag} . g ⁱ . p ^{hyogs}	नित्यनित्यपञ्च 29, 30.
r ^{tags}	हेतु 7, 38, 39; छिद्र 55, 56.
r ^{tags} . k ^{yi} . s ^{kyou}	हेतुरोप 62.
r ^{tags} . l ^{tar} . s ^{nau}	हेत्वाभास 60.
r ^{tog} . pa. d ^{au} . b ^{cas} . y ^{es} . pa	कल्पनाज्ञान 59.
r ^{tog} . pa. d ^{au} . b ^{ral} . ba	कल्पनारहित 54, कल्पनापोद 54.
r ^{togs} . pa	प्रत्यायन 10, (प्रतीति) 58.
r ^{togs} . p ^{ahi} . d ^{us}	* प्रत्यायन (for प्रत्यायनकाल) 63.
r ^{togs} . p ^{hyir}	संविदे 1.
r ^{togs} . p ^{ahi} . p ^{hyir}	(प्रतीतिः) 58.
l ^{ta} . bu	(इव) 26; इति 15, 31, (46), (50).
l ^{tar} . s ^{nau} . b ^{cas} . pa	साभास 1.
s ^{tan}	आसन 37 ^r .
s ^{te}	2, 3, 6, 7, 8 ^r , 9, 10 ^r , 21, 28, 29, 36, 44 ^r .
s ^{ton} . pa	* कथ्यते (for दृश्यते) 9.
b ^{stan} . b ^{cas}	शास्त्र 1.
t ^{hams} . c ^{ad} ſa	सर्वत्र 31, 32.
t ^{he} . t ^{shom} . g ^{yi} . r ^{gyu}	संशयहेतु 30.
t ^{he} . t ^{shom} . g ^{yi} . r ^{gyu} . ſid	संशयहेतुत्व 34.
t ^{he} . t ^{shom} . z ^a . n ^{as} . m ^a . g ^{rub} . pa	संक्षिप्तासिद्ध 23, 26.
t ^{he} . t ^{shom} . z ^a . ba	संक्षिप्तमान 26.
t ^{hun} . m ^{on}	साधारण 28, 29.
t ^{hun} . m ^{on} . ba. ſid. k ^{yi} . p ^{hyir}	साधारणत्वाद् 29.

- thun, mon, ma, yin, pa
thod
mthun, pañi, phyogs
mthun, phyogs
mthun, phyogs, kyī, phyogs, cig, gi-yul, la, yod
mthun, phyogs, kyī, phyogs geig, la, yod
mthun, phyogs, la, khyab, pa
mthoñ
dan
dam
dam, bcab, bañi, skyon
duñ, dañ, ka, phyis, shes, pa, bshin
dus
de
de, ltar
de, ni
dchi, phyir
deñi, bzlog, pa
de, la
de, las
don
don, mthoñ, ba
don, byed, nus, pa
don, gshan,
drug, du, dbye
dro, ba, med,
bdag
bdag, nid, kyis, rab, tu, rtogs, par, bya, bañi, don
lde, ba, dañ, nam, mkhañ, chos, mthun, pañi,
dper, byas, pa, nid, kyis
असाधारण 28, 29.
कपाळ 14.
सपञ्च 4, 5^r, 8.
सपञ्च 5, (10), 31^r, 32, 33^r.
सपञ्चैकदेशवृत्ति 31.
,, 28.
सपञ्चव्यापिन् 28, 32.
वृद्ध 6, 8, 10^r, 42, 43, 45, 46^r,
(50).
च 1^r, 2, 4^r, (6), 7, 9, 21, 23^r
28, 30, 35^r, (37^r), 38^r, 39,
41, 44^r, 45, 47^r, (50) (62^r).
वा 6.
प्रतिज्ञादोष 21.
चङ्खुप्रतिवत् 14.
काळ 10.
तद् 4, (5), 8, 9, 10^r, 38, 42,
43, 46^r, 51, 54, 57, 63, 65.
तथा 37, 38.
तदि 29, 30.
तस्मात् 32, 33.
तद्विपरीत 39.
तत्र 2, 3, 8, 12, 22, 24, 29,
31^r, 32^r, 33, 36, 42^r, 44,
54.
तस्मात् 60.
अर्थे 2, 5, 54.
अर्थदेशेन 55.
(अर्पकियावृत्ति) 58.
अर्थान्तर 59.
पदप्रकार 23.
(अवृत्त्य) 20.
आत्मन् 1, 18, 19.
आत्मप्रदायनार्थ 53.
*घञाकारयारिषापभ्येण (for घञा-
कारयारिषापभ्येण) 33.

hde ba la sogs pa

hdi

hdi lta

hdi ltar

hdi yan

hdiu rtags

hdir

hdi la sogs pa

hdod pa

hdod pa

hdu bar byed pa can

hdus pa mid

rdul phran

rdul phran tnam lus can mid yin pahi
phyir ro

rdul phran la sogs pa

rdul phran rab bshin

ldog pa

ldog pa mid kyi phyir

ldog pa phyin ci ldog pa

ldog pa med pa

bsdus pa

na

nam mkhah

nam mkhah med pa mid du brjod pa la

nam mkhah bshin

nam mkhah la sogs pa

nam mkhah la sogs pa la med p

ni

gnod pa med pa can

snam

dp*

समादि 19, 33*

इरम् 30 31*, 32*, 33*, 36, 39*,
(56), एतद् 10, 21, 52*, 64*.

इति 3

*तपसा (for एवम्) 5, 10, 11,
एवम् 29, *पपा (for एवम्)
43.

एतदपि 32, 33

अय हेतु 36, 37, 38

अत्र 9, 56

(इरमादि) 56

इप्सित 3

इह 11.

समवायिकारण 15

सवातत्त्व 37*

परमाद्यु 33, 43

परमागुना मूर्तत्वात् 42

परमागुवारि 33

परमाद्युवत् 42 43

म्यावृत्त 47* 48* 49

*म्यावृत्तत्वात् 30

व्यतिरेकविपरीत 41 51

अव्यतिरेक 41, 50

सयद 1

30

आकाश 6, 10 27, 33* (44),
(50)

आशयासत्त्ववारिन् प्रति 27

अक्रान्तवत् 44 49, 9

आकाशादि 31

नाकाशादौ 32

1^a c (दि) 2, 4 6, 7 8 9,

10 etc

अविच्छेद 3

(कम्बु) 59

दशान्त 2 7

dpe. ltar. snañ. ba

dpeñi. skyon

dper. na

spyi

spyi. dañ. khyad. par. bshin

phyin. ci. log. tu. sgrub. par. byed. pa

phyir. rgyol

phyogs

phyogs. kyi. skyon

phyogs. kyi. skyon. brjod. pa

phyogs. kyi. chos

phyogs. kyi. chos. brjod. pa

phyogs. kyi. chos. ñid

phyogs. skyon. med. pa

phyogs. brjod. pa

phyogs. ltar. snañ. ba

phyogs. tsam. bsgrebs. pañi. phyir

bum. pa

byas. pa

byas. pa. ñid

byas. pa. ñid. kyi. phyir

byas. pa. ma. yin. pa

byas. pa. med. pa

byas. pañi. phyir. shes. pa

bye. brag. pa

blo

dbañ. po. so. solñi. dbañ. po. la

dbu. ma. pa

dbye. ba. mañ. po

dbye. ba. bshi

hbyuñ. ba. hñus. pa

hbras. bu

दृष्टान्तभास 41, 47, 52.

दृष्टान्तदोष 52, दृष्टदृष्टान्तदोष 64.

पपा 6, 8, 9, 10^r, 12, 13, 14,
15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 42,
43.

सामान्य 5.

सामान्यविशेषवत् 38.

विपरीतसाधन 35^r.

मासिक 2, 63.

पक्ष 2^r, 3, 9, 32^r, 33, 39, 52.

पक्षदोष 62.

पक्षदोषवचन 64.

(पक्षधर्म) 6.

पक्षधर्मवचन 10.

पक्षधर्मत्व 4.

अदृष्टपक्ष 64.

पक्षवचन 10.

पक्षमास 11.

दिङ्मात्रसिद्धये 65.

पक्ष 5, 8, (10), 13, 29, 31,
32^r, 33^r, 34, 44, 45 39.

कृतक 8, *कृतकत्व (for कृतक)
10^r, 46^r, (51).

कृतकत्व 6, 45.

कृतकत्वात् 25, 34, 36.

अकृतक 6, 9.

अकृतक 9.

*कृतकत्वादिति (for कृतकादिति)
10.

वैशेषिक 15, 19.

इति 43^r.

अधर्म्य प्रति 54.

(साध्यमिक) 56.

बहुप्रकार 60.

चतुष्प्रकार 22.

भूततद्भास 26.

कउ 57.

ma. grub. pa
ma. grub. pah. rtags ſid
ma. grub. pah. rtags
ma. nes. pa

ma. nes. pa. med. pah. rtags
ma. nes. pah. rtags ſid
ma. nes. pah. rtags
ma. tshan
ma. tshan. ba. ſid. brjed. pa
ma. rtogs. pa
ma. rtogs. pa. don. ltar. suan. ba
ma. rtogs. par. hgyur. ba
ma. byas
ma. byas. pa. ſid.
ma. mo
ma. cha
mi. hkhru. ba. h. phyir. ro
mig. gis. gzun. bar. bya. ba. ſid
mig. la. sogs. pa.
mi. hgal. ba. h. rtags.
mi. hgyur. ba
min
ma. rtag. -pa

mi. rtag. pa. ſid
mi. rtag. pa. ſid. kyi. phyir
mi. rtag. pa. ſid. do
mi. rtag. pa. ſid. yod
mi. mthun. pah. phyogs
mi. mthun. phyogs
mi. mthun. phyogs. kyi. phyogs. gcig. gi.
yul. la. yod
mi. mthun. phyogs. kyi. yul. gcig. la. yod
mi. mthun. phyogs. kho. na. la. yod. pas.
mi. mthun. phyogs. la. khyab. pa
mi. mgo. thod

असिद्ध 22^r, 62.
(असिद्धहेतुः) 62.
असिद्धहेतुक 64.
अनेकान्तिक 22, 28, 29, 31,
32, 33, 62.
एकान्तहेतुक 64.
(अनैकान्तिकहेतुः) 62.
अनेकान्तहेतुक 64
नवत्व 62.
न्यूनत्ववचन 64.
अप्रतीत 2.
(अप्रतीतार्थभाष) 60.
(अप्रतीत - or अभ्युत्पन्न-भूत, 60.
(अकृतक) 51.
(अकृतकरव) 50.
मातृ 16.
शयन 37^r.
अव्यभिचारः 38, 39.
वाङ्मयत्व 24.
चक्षुरादि 37.
अविद्वद्हेतुक 64.
अभूत 64.
नामन् 54.
अविरूप 3, 4, 6, 5^r, 8, 10, 33,
34, 46^r, (56).
अनित्यत्व 9, 31, 45
अनित्यत्वात् 31^r, 43, 44, 47^r.
अनित्यत्वं विषये 32
अनित्यत्व विषये 31.
विषय 4, 31^r.
विषय 6^r, 32, 33.
विषयकदेशवृत्ति 28.
विषयकदेशवृत्ति 32.
विषय एव भावात् ('भावेन) 36.
विषयव्यापिन् 28.
नरसिंहकपाठ 14

mi. rigs	अयुक्ति 65.
me	(अग्नि) 20.
me. sgrub. pa	अग्निसिद्धि 26.
med	न 31, 33, 38, 47, 48, 49; नास्ति 42, 43, (56).
med. pa	असत्त्व 4; नास्ति 6; (अभाव) 6; अभाव 9; असत्त्व 44.
med. pa. rkyen. gyis. byas. pa. nid	*अतस्प्रत्ययकर्तृत्व (for °कृतत्व) 39.
med. pa. nid. du. hdod. pa. la	*असत्त्ववादिनं प्रति (for °कामं°) 44.
med. pañi. phyir	*असम्भावाम् (for अभावात्) 30.
med. pas	विना 45.
suras	उक्त 9.
btsal. ma. thag. tu. byuñ. ba	प्रयत्नान्तरीयक 6.
btsal. ma. thog. tu. byun. ba. nid. kyi. phyir	प्रयत्नान्तरीयकत्वात् 36.
rtsol. ba. las. byun	(प्रयत्नोत्पन्न) 31.
rtsol. ba. las. byuñ. ba	*प्रयत्नान्तरीयक (for प्रयत्नोत्पन्न) 32.
rtsol. bas. byuñ. ba. ma. yin	*अप्रयत्नान्तरीयक (for अभय- तोत्पन्न) 31.
rtsol. ma. byun	(प्रयत्नादुत्पन्न) 31.
tshad. ma	प्रमाण 53, (58).
tshad. ma. nid. dag. go	द्वे एव प्रमाणे 53.
tshig. don. cun. zad	परार्थमात्र 65.
tshuñ. bar	(सर्वथा) 56.
tshul. gsum. po	त्रिरूप 4, 56.
mtshuns. pa	समल 5.
rdzas	द्रव्य 38.
rdzas. gcig. pa. can. nid. kyi. phyir	एकद्रव्यवत्त्वात् 38.
rdzas. la. sogs. pañi. ma. yin. pa	द्रव्यादिप्रतिषेध 38.
ses	ज्ञानं 54, 57, 60.
gram	वन्द्या 15.
zer. ba	प्रतीति 46, 51.
gzugs. la. sogs	रूपारि 51.
gzugs. la. sogs. don. la	रूपारो अर्थे 54.
gzugs. la. sogs. pa. rtogs. pa. nid. kyi. phyir ro	रूपाधिगमत्वात् 57.
bzlog. pa. brjod. pa	व्यतिरेकवचन 10.

ham	वा 26, 59.
han	(भवि) 58.
han. dag	(सम्पद्) 58.
yan	युनर 4, (5), 5; भवि 9, 11, (28), (30), 31, 32, 47.
yan. gan	कि युनर 4; वा युनर 5.
yan. no	(च) 4.
yan. dag. par. tshan. ba	सम्पत् 64.
yan. dag. par. rab. lu. Hogs. no. med. pañi. phyir	*प्रतिपादनासेभर (for सम्पत्प्रति- पादनाभावात्) 21.
yan. lag	अदपर 10, 37.
yan. lag. bshin	अदपर 37.
yid. ches. pas. gnod pa	आगमविषय 15.
yid. ches. pas. bsal. ba.	आगमविषय 11.
yin	(भवति) 10*, 32.
yin. pas	(भवतीति) 5.
yin. pas. so	(भवतीति) 37.
yin. la	(भरति) 37.
yul. cig	एकदेश 31, 37.
yod	*अभाव (for भार) 9; विपत्ते 38*; अस्ति 42, 43.
yon tan	गुण 58.
yon. tan. gyi. gshi. aid. lyi. phyir	गुणाभयवात् 27.
yon. tan. dan. las. lyi. ran tshin. yin. pahi. phyir	*गुणकर्मण्य भावात् (for स्वभावात्) 28.
yod. dan. med	भारभावात् 9.
yod. pa	सत्त्व 4; अस्ति 8; सत्त्व 44; विपत्ते 44; वर्तते 54.
yod pa. tkyen. gyis. byed. pa. aid	सत्त्वप्रत्ययार्थत्वं 59.
yod. pa. aid	*अभावात् (for भावात्) 38.
yod. par. nes. pa	(सत्त्वनिश्चय) 4.
yod la	विपत्ते 31.
tan. gi. matshan. aid. lyi. yul. aid	स्वच्छागमविषय 59.
tan gi tshig gis. gnod. pa	स्वच्छागमविषय 16.
tan. gi. tshig gis. bsal. ba	स्वच्छागमविषय 11.

rañ. gis
 rab. tu. grags. pa
 rab. tu. rtogs. (daa) ljbrel
 rab. tu. rtogs. par. byed. pañi. phyir. ro
 shes. paño
 rab. tu. ces. par. byed. pa
 rig. phyir
 rigs
 rigs. la. sogs. pa
 re. shig
 rlañs. pa. la. sogs. pañi. dños. po
 las
 la. sogs
 la. sogs. pa
 la. sogs. pa. rñams
 lus. can. ñid. yin. pañi. phyir
 lus. can. ma. yin. ñid
 lus. can. ma. yin. pa
 lus. can. ma. yin. pa. ñid
 lus. can. ma. yin. pa. ñid. kyī. phyir
 legs. ces. bya
 shc. na
 shes
 shes. pa
 shes. pa. lta. buño
 shes. paño
 gshan
 gshan. gyi. don. ñid
 gshan. gyi. don yin. te
 gshan. gyis phyogs
 gshan. rtogs. phyir
 gshan. las
 gshul. bya. ñid. kyī. phyir
 gshi. ma. grub. pa

स्वयम् 3.
 प्रसिद्ध 3, 3.
 प्रसिद्धस्वरूप 20.
 प्रतिपाद्य इति (प्रत्यक्ष्यत इति) १.
 + प्रदर्शयते (for प्रजायते) 45. ॥
 संविदे 1.
 युक्ति 65.
 जात्यादि 54.
 (सम्प्रति, तावत्) 47; (किञ्चित्)
 बाष्पादिभाव 26.
 कर्मन् 33, 47'.
 आदि 2, 9.
 आदि 3, 37'.
 आद्यः 9.
 मूर्तत्वात् 44, 48.
 अमूर्तत्वं 42.
 अमूर्त 42, 43.
 अमूर्तत्वं 33', 42, 43, 48.
 अमूर्तत्वात् 38, 42, 43, 47, 49.
 (छत्रेया) 65.
 चेत् 4, (5).
 इति 26, (36). 46' 49, 51, 59.
 इति 6, 10', 25, 27, 33, 34,
 37, 44', 64
 इति 12, 14, 16, 19.
 इति 6, 8, 9, 28, 30, (31).
 45, 54, 58.
 अन्य 30, पर 10, 37.
 पारार्थ्य 37
 परार्थाः 37.
 परपक्ष 64.
 परसंविदे 1.
 अन्यत्र 65.
 प्रमेयत्वात् 29'.
 आभयासिद्ध 23, 27.

bshag

bshin

bshir. dbye

sahs. rgyas. r--

sahs. rgyas. pa. la

sems. can. gyi. yan. lag. yin. pahl. phyir

sems. dpah can

sun. hbyin. -pa

sun. hbyin. ltar. suan ba

gsum

gsum. pa.

bsal. ba

lhan. cig. yod. pa.

(स्थितम्) 61.

(-रत्न in the sense of रत्न) 6.

चतु.प्रकार 35.

बौद्ध 17.

बौद्ध प्रति 13, 19.

प्राग्यज्ञस्यात् 14.

* चेतन (for चित्तश्चर) 13.

दूषण 1, 61, 63.

दूषणाभास 64.

त्रि 10.

(तृतीयः) 22.

विच्छ 11'.

सहभाव 45

APPENDIX

THE CHINESE WORDS AND SENTENCES QUOTED OR
REFERRED TO IN THE COMPARATIVE NOTES.

The figures refer to the serial numbers

1. 諸 論 要 義.
2. 同 品 定 有 性.
3. 謂
4. 此 中 所 作 性 或 勤 勇 焦
間 所 發 性. 徧 是 宗 法 性
同 品 定 有 性. 異 品 遍
焦 性. 是 焦 常 等 因.
5. 等.
6. 似 立 宗
7. 自 教 相 違
8. 相 符 極 成.
9. 懷 兔 非 月 有 故

10 和 合 因 緣。

11 如 是 多 言。 是 遣 諸 法 自
相 門 故。 不 容 成 故。 立
焦 果 故。 名 似 立 宗 過。

12 一 不 成

13 等。

14 非 勤 勇 焦 間 所 發 宗。 以
瓶 等 爲 異 品 於 彼 徧 有。

15 聲 是 勤 勇 焦 間 所 發 焦
常 性 故 勤 勇 焦 間 所 發
宗 以 瓶 等 爲 同 品 具 焦
常 性 於 此 徧 有 以 電 空
等 爲 異 品。 於 彼 一 分 電
等 是 有 空 等 是 焦 是
故 如 前 亦 爲 不 定

16. 極 微 等.
17. 相 違.
18. 德 業 故
- 19 俱 決 定 故.
- 20 已 說 似 因
21. 焦 質 礙.
- 22 有 質 礙 性
- 23 焦 質 礙 性
- 24 非 正 能 立.
- 25 如 前
26. 由 彼 爲 因. 於 所 比 義 有
正 智 生. 了 智 有 火 或 焦
常 等 是 名 比 量
27. 如 有 作 用 而 顯 現 故. 亦
名 爲 量

28 衣 等

29 若 似 因 智 爲 先 所 起 諸
似 義 智 名 似 比 量

30 因 明 入 正 理 論

ADDENDA ET CORRIGENDA.

TEXT.

- § 20, l. 1, read *dañ* for *yait*.
 Page 2, Note 12, read *may* after *gr. yul* for *is to* and add the following 'Cf. § 28, ll. 9, 5; § 31, l. 1.'
 § 29, Note 19, l. 2, before *शब्दः* add *अनित्यः* and strike off *नित्य इति*.
 § 31, l. 2. read *ba. las* for *bas* after *rtsol*.
 § 34, l. 2. strike off *S* of *ste*.
 Page 5, Note 21, l. 1, add *Śabda* before *āhosvit* striking off *iti* at the end.
 § 38, l. 1, read *tu* for *du* after *lag*.
 Page 6, Note 27, add 'So in § 37, l. 4; § 38, l. 5. But the original reading may be defended.'
 Page 6, Note 29, ll 5-6, strike off *bhāvatvām* and *or*.
 Page 9. Note 42, l. 9, read *mi* for *me* before *rtag*.

COMPARATIVE NOTES.

1. 9, l. 3, read निश्चित for निश्चय before सत्त्वम्; l. 7, delete 'T' T' add here चेत् 'if' (shes, na) while.'
2. 13, l. 1, strike off ' (or सापन)', and read *while* for *which*.
2. 16-17, l. 9, after परस्परसम्बन्धप्रसिद्ध. add 'But this is tantamount to प्रसिद्धसम्बन्ध'.
2. 20, l. 1, for चन्द्रो न दशाहो read 'दशो (Ch lit. दशाहो) न चन्द्रो'.
3. 3-4, l. 1, read सुखादि for खादि.
3. 4, 5, add the following at the end of the note: 'The reading प्रसिद्धसम्बन्धः together with its example भाषणः शब्द इति in the Skt. text is, however, quite right, as says PNT with its commentary, *Ratnākaraśāntārīkā* (Vl. 39). In it this पञ्चागण is described as प्रतिपाद्यवर्मादेशोपेक्ष and the commentator tells us that it can also be termed सिद्धसाधन and प्रसिद्धसम्बन्ध. Says he "प्रसिद्धमेवार्थमुदाहर्यतीति व्यर्थतत्प्रयोगः । सिद्धसाधनः प्रसिद्धसम्बन्ध इत्यपि संशयमस्य-विदम् ।"
3. 5, l. 2, add 'for एषाम्' at the end.
3. 5-7 l. 17, add नाम before दोषाः.
3. 6, omit 'T' and read 'omits' for 'omit.'
3. 9, l. 3, after एष्टतद्विदः add 'lit. एष्टविदः.'

- 4 8 10, l 1, add 'Ch' after T', l 4, read आसद्वा for आसद्
- 4 21, between Notes 60 and 61 add the following note '4 22, after सधर्मेण T' adds कृतकत्वेन (byas pa lrid lris)'
- 5 15 16, ll 6 7, read *hahiz* striking out all the words in brackets
- 5 18, l 1, read सप्रत्यय° for सप्रत्यय°
- 6 2 3 l 1, delete 'T' before 'Ch'
- 7 5, l 3 read अव्यतिरेको for अव्यतिरेको l 10, at the end add 'In the Skt text अपूर्तलम् is a misprint for मूर्तलम्,' and in l 12 read *means* for *mean* In the next line add after दर्शनात् 'The last part may be better translated thus अनित्यत्वं मूर्तलं च दृढमिति.'
- 7 9, l 13, read मूर्तमनित्यम् for मूर्तम नित्यम्
- 7 13 l 7 add the following at the end of the note 'and NB Tika tappanī (B B), p 19, ll 1 12'
- 7 14 l 3 add the following at the end 'But the latter adds सभय (cheng) before हान in चत्तुर्हानमर्थे रूपान्तौ'
- 7 15 16 l 2, delete z after *chien*
- 7 16 17, l 26 beginning with 'Ch has समात् read यत्रानुमेयेत्यर्थे for वस्तिनर्थे
- 7 19 The sentence उक्तं °द्वयत्वं is quoted in *Syadvadaman-jarv*, sl 16 with the reading प्रमाणक for कल
- 7 20 21, ll 5 6 strike out the following Ch agrees with T excepting that for *sam by* (स्वयं) in the latter the former has *z t ng*° (स्वयं दि or स्वाणि T' differ from them both and read in its place for पठ Ch has पठादि or पठा (*z t ng*°) and for तदर्थस्वयं विषयत्वात् it reads तदर्थस्वयं विषयत्वात् (=तदर्थस्वयं विषयत्वात्) T' follows it read ing
- P 27 l 4 read 125 for 126 and l 6 read 126 for 127
- P 28, l 29 read कल्याणमि, for प्राप्तेन जुग for जुग, and Ju for Jus l 30 read °निक वात् for °वायसात्
- P 29, l 4, read *dge bces* for *dge ges*

INDEX OF PROPER NAMES

A Sanskrit Tibetan

Add *pa* after *cin* and *rgyas* in ll 1 and 5 respectively
bottom

Read *smra* for *sgra* before *ba* in l. 2 from the bottom.

B. Tibetan Sanskrit.

Add *pa* after *can* and *rgyas* in ll. 3 and 7 respectively.

Read *smra* for *sgra* before *ba* in l. 4.

Make this correction also in the Index of words and Phrases, pp. 43, 47, ll. 9, 6 respectively.

GAEKWAD'S ORIENTAL SERIES.

Published under the Authority of the Government of
His Highness the Maharaja Gaekwad of Baroda

AT THE

CENTRAL LIBRARY, BARODA (India).

GENERAL EDITOR:

BENOYTOSH BHATTACHARYYA, M. A., Ph. D.

Select Opinions.

The Series as a whole will bring notable accession to our knowledge of the immense and wonderful Sanskrit Literature. The volumes are excellently printed and edited, and the notes and introductions are scholarly and useful.

(Dr.) F. W. THOMAS, LIBRARIAN, INDIA OFFICE.

The editions have been executed with the greatest care. The prefaces are learned and informing. They are worthy of the State which published them.

(Mahamahopadhyaya Dr.) Haraprasad Shastri, M.A., C I. E., Hon. D Litt.

The inclusion of Prakrit works in the series is an excellent idea. Owing to the practical monopoly of Sanskrit in India, the study of the Prakrits has been too much neglected there, though these mediæval vernaculars as connecting links between Sanskrit and the innumerable dialects of modern India, are of great philological, and to some extent, literary importance...The Maharaja is certainly to be congratulated on his plan of bringing out this series.

—LONDON TIMES, LITERARY SUPPLEMENT.

GAEKWAD'S ORIENTAL SERIES.

CRITICAL EDITIONS OF UNPRINTED SANSKRIT WORKS, EDITED BY
COMPETENT SCHOLARS, AND PUBLISHED BY
THE CENTRAL LIBRARY, BARODA.

BOOKS PUBLISHED.

1. *Rāvyamīmāṃsā*: a work on poetics, by Rājasekhara (880-923 A. D.), edited by C. D. Dalal, and R. Anantakrishna Sastry, 1916.
Re-issue. 1934 Rs. 2-4

This book has been set as a text-book for the Acharya Examination of the Patna University.

The first two numbers are valuable works, and were hitherto quite unknown to me. The Introduction to *Rāvyamīmāṃsā* is an interesting and an important contribution to our knowledge of ancient India.

(Sir) GEORGE A. GRIENSON.

2. *Naranārāyanānanda*: a poem on the Puranic story of Arjuna and Krishna's rambles on Mount Girnar, by Vastupāla, Minister of King Virādhavala of Dhola, composed between Samvat 1217 and 1287, i. e. A. D. 1221 and 1231; edited by C. D. Dalal and R. Anantakrishna Sastry, 1916 1-4
3. *Tarkasāgraha*: a work on Philosophy (refutation of Vaiśeṣika theory of atomic creation) by Ānandajñāna or Ānandagiri, the famous commentator on Śaṅkarācārya's Bhāṣyas, who flourished in the latter half of the 13th century. edited by T. M. Tripathi, 1917 2-0
4. *Pārthaparākrama*: a drama describing Arjuna's recovery of the cows of King Virāta, by Prahlādanandava, the founder of Pīlānpur and the younger brother of the Paramara King of Chandrāvati, (a state of Mārwar), and a feudatory of the kings of Guzerat, who was a Yuvarāja in Samvat 1220 or A. D. 1164; edited by C. D. Dalal, 1917 0-6
5. *Rāṣṭradharmasa*: an historical poem (Mahākāvya) describing the history of the Bagulas of Mayūragiri, from Rāṣṭradhva, king of Kanauj and the originator of the dynasty, to Nārāyaṇa Shala of Mayūragiri by Rudra Kavi composed in Saka 1518 or A. D. 1596; edited by Pandit Embar Krishnatnacharya with Introduction by C. D. Dalal, 1917. 1-12
6. *Līlāgānuśāna*: on Grammar, by Vāmana, who lived between the last quarter of the 8th century and the first quarter of the 9th century; edited by C. D. Dalal, 1918 0-8

7. **Vasantavilāsa:** an historical poem (Mahākāvya) describing the life of Vastupāla and the history of Guzerat, by Bālachandrasūri, (from Modheraka or Modhera in Kadi Prant, Baroda State), contemporary of Vastupāla, composed after his death for his son in Samvat 1296 (A. D. 1240): edited by C. D. Dalal, 1917 1-8
8. **Rāpakasaṅgam:** six dramas by Vatsarāja, minister of Paramardideva of Kalinjara, who lived between the 2nd half of the 12th and the 1st quarter of 13th century: edited by C. D. Dalal, 1918 2-4
9. **Mohaparājaya:** an allegorical drama describing the overcoming of King Moha (Temptation), or the conversion of Kumārāpāla, the Chalukya King of Guzerat, to Jainism, by Yas'ahpāla an officer of King Ajayadeva, son of Kumārāpāla, who reigned from A. D. 1229 to 1232: edited by Muni Chaturvijaya, with Introduction and Appendices by C. D. Dalal, 1918... .. 2-0
10. **Hamamiramadamardana:** a drama glorifying the two brothers Vastupāla and Tejapāla and their King Viradhaṇḍa of Dholka, by Jayasimhasūri, pupil of Virasūri, and an Āchārya of the temple of Munisuvrata at Broach, composed between Samvat 1276 and 1286 or A. D. 1220 and 1239: edited by C. D. Dalal, 1920 2-0
11. **Udayasundarikathā:** a romance (Champh, in prose and poetry) by Soddhala, a contemporary of and patronised by the three brothers Chohittarāja, Nāgarjuna, and Mummupirāja, successive rulers of Konkan composed between A. D. 1026 and 1050: edited by C. D. Dalal and Pandit Embar Krishnamacharya, 1920 2-4
12. **Mahāvidyāvidambana:** a work on Nyāya Philosophy, by Bhatṭa Vābindra who lived about A. D. 1210 to 1274: edited by M. R. Telang, 1920. 2-4
13. **Prācinagurjarakāvyaśaṅgraha:** a collection of old Gujarati poems dating from 12th to 15th centuries A. D.: edited by C. D. Dalal, 1920. 2-4
14. **Kumārāpālapratibodha:** a biographical work in Prākṛta, by Somaprabhāchārya composed in Samvat 1241 or A. D. 1195: edited by Muni Janavijaya, 1920 7-8
15. **Gapakārikā:** a work on Philosophy (Pāśupata School) by Bhāsarvajña who lived in the 2nd half of the 10th century: edited by C. D. Dalal, 1921— 1-4

16. *Sangitamakaranda*: a work on Music, by Nārada edited by M. R. Telang 1920 2-0
17. *Kavindrācārya List*: List of Sanskrit works in the collection of Kavindrācārya, a Benares Pandit (1656 A.D.) edited by R. Ananta-krishna Sastry, with a foreword by Dr. Ganganatha Jha. 1921. 0-12
18. *Vārāhagrhyasūtra*: Vedic ritual (domestic) of the Yajurveda. edited by Dr. R. Shamasastri. 1920 0-12
19. *Lekhapaddhati*: a collection of models of state and private documents, dating from 8th to 15th centuries A. D.; edited by C. D. Dalal and G. K. Shrigondekar 1923 3-0

Lekhapaddhati opens a new line; we know almost nothing on the art of writing letters in Ancient India. —SYLVAIN LEVI.

This unique work has been edited very ably by the second Editor with an interesting preface, five appendices, a list of important persons and of prominent places, and a full Anglo-Sanskrit glossary. It contains numerous original specimens of all kinds of letters, deeds and documents in Sanskrit, and also quotations from the classical authors. It contains also many vernacular words and phrases, most of which are now obsolete. In order to ascertain the meaning of these obsolete words the learned second Editor had to travel over districts and to mix freely with the villagers. Thanks to his untiring zeal, we have at last been presented with a fairly good glossary which clears up the meaning of most of these terms which have hitherto baffled the endeavours of many an erudite scholar. Like many other works on letter-writing in other languages, it is by no means a dry work, but is interspersed with humorous touches. This had really added to the importance of the book.

—CALCUTTA REVIEW.

20. *Bhavisyattakahā* or *Pañcamikahā*: a romance in Apabhramśa language by Dhanapāla (circa 12th century) edited by C. D. Dalal, and Dr. P. D. Gune, 1923 6-0

A very useful and valuable contribution of that exceedingly important and still imperfectly known stage of linguistic evolution which linked the older Prakṛits to the modern vernaculars. —J. R. A. S.

21. *A Descriptive Catalogue of the Palm-leaf and Important Paper MSS. in the Bhandars at Jessalmere*, compiled by C. D. Dalal, and edited by L. H. Gandhi. 1924 3-4

The editor has added an introduction of 70 pages on the most important works, together with indices of titles, authors and other points of interest. The book is an important addition to the bibliography of Prākṛt and Sanskrit.

—J R A S

22, 23 **Parasurāmakalpśūtra** a work on Tantra, with commentary by Rāmesvara and Paddhati by Umānanda edited by A. Mahadeva Sastry, B. A. 2 vols. 1923 11-0

24. **Tantrarahasya** a work on the Prābhakara School of Pārvamīmāṃsā, by Rāmānujācārya edited by Dr R. Shamasastri. 1923 1-8

throw considerable light upon the arcana of their subject, and are adequately edited with an introduction by Dr R. Sama Sastry —J R A S

25, 32 **Samarāṅgaṇa** a work on Architecture, town-planning and engineering by King Bhoja of Dhara (11th century) edited by Mahamahopadhyaya T. Ganapati Sastry, Ph. D. 2 vols, 1924-1925 10 0

Mahamahopadhyaya T. Ganapati Sastry's edition of King Bhoja's rare book on architecture will be highly appreciated by all Sanskrit scholars.

—M. WINTERVITZ

The work treats in detail of the selection of sites, of the planning of towns and villages, the building of houses, halls and palaces, stables for elephants and horses, the construction of various machines etc.

—VIENNA ORIENTAL JOURNAL

26 **Sādhanaṁālā** a Buddhist Tantric text of rituals, dated 1165 A. D. consisting of more than 300 small works composed by distinguished writers edited by Benoytosh Bhattacharyya, M. A., Ph. D. 2 vols. vol. I 1925 5-0

The issue is one of great importance and I feel sure that the edition will be most warmly welcomed. This is an important addition to our materials for the study of Buddhist Iconography and that special development of Buddhism which the text illustrates so abundantly.

—JORMAN VAN MANEN

The editor has well accomplished his task and deserves praise. The edition is in no way inferior, if not superior, to many of the European and Asiatic editions of the Buddhist Sanskrit works.

—INDIAN HISTORICAL QUARTERLY,

The edition evinces painstaking critical care is a valuable contribution to the Buddhist Iconography and would be welcome also by the specialist

—JOURNAL OF THE BIHAR & ORISSA RESEARCH SOCIETY

Iconographic interest apart, the *Sādhanamālā* presents philological and historical problems of great importance

—MODERN REVIEW

Sādhanamālā is particularly important for any scholar engaged in Buddhist researches.

—STYLIAN LEVI

The work is in the mixed Sanskrit of the Buddhists similar to that used in *Lalitavistara*, etc. A very vivid picture is thrown in these 170 *Sādhanas* on one section of the Buddhist society that had already introduced into itself the prohibited intricacies of idol-worship. It further gives an insight into the development of the Vajrayana system of Buddhist philosophy, which is so little known to the oriental scholars dealing with Buddhism. Our hearty thanks are due to the publishers for the high class printing and exquisite get-up of the volume.

—CALCUTTA REVIEW

27. A Descriptive Catalogue of MSS in the Central Library, Baroda. Vol 1 (Veda, Vedāṅgās and Upaniṣads) compiled by G. K. Shrivastava, M. A. and K. S. Ramaswami Sastry 1925 6-8

The Catalogue of MSS is particularly welcome. I am looking forward with keen interest to the following parts of the Catalogue

—M. WINTERNIETZ

Describes 513 Vedic works running to 1420 manuscripts, excellently arranged and classified

—MODERN REVIEW

28. *Mānasollāsa* or *Abhisantārthacintamani* an encyclopaedic work divided into one hundred chapters treating of one hundred different topics by Somadeva, a Chalukya king of the 12th century edited by G. K. Shrivastava, M. A. 2 vols vol I. 1925 2-8

Mānasollāsa on account of its encyclopaedic character ought to be consulted by all scholars

—STYLIAN LEVI.

A voluminous treatise consists of five sections, each comprising 20 chapters. These are concerned respectively with the means of acquiring the kingdom and preserving the same and the description of the royal enjoyments, recreations and games. We await the publication of the second volume with great interest.

—INDIAN HISTORICAL QUARTERLY

Stupendous work extending to about 8000 Granthas and divided into 100 chapters palpably an encyclopaedic summary of all the available works on technical sciences.

—MODERN REVIEW

The work treats of many subjects and gives the maximum information in minimum space. To be brief, we can unhesitatingly designate it as the true Encyclopedia of the Sanskrit language, in fact our author calls it the Jagadā cāryapustaka. The get-up of the book is good. —CALCUTTA REVIEW.

29. **Nalāvilāsa** a drama by Rāmachandrasūri, pupil of Hamaobhandrasūri, describing the Pauranic story of Nala and Damayanti edited by G. K. Shrivasthakar and L. B. Gandhi 1926 2-4
- 30, 31. **Tattvasangraha** a Buddhist philosophical work of the 8th century by Śāntarakṣita, a Professor at Nālandā with Pañjikā (commentary) by his disciple Kamalaśīla, also a Professor in Nālandā (about 750 A. D.) edited by Pandit Embar Krishnamacharya with an English Foreword by Dr. B. Bhattacharyya, M. A., Ph. D. 2 vols. 1926 . . . 24-0
- 33, 34. **Mīrat-i-Ahmadi** with its Khātima or Supplement By Ali Mahammad Khan, the last Moghul Dewan of Gujarat edited in the original Persian by Syed Nawabali, Professor of Persian, Baroda College, 2 vols. (Vol. I in the Press), Vol. II ready about December 1926 12-0
35. **Mānavagṛhyasūtra** a work on Vedic ritual (domestic) of the Yajurveda with the Bhāṣya of Aṣṭāvakra edited by Pandit Ramakrishna Harshaṇi Śāstri, with a preface by Prof. B. O. Lele
SHORTLY.

BOOKS IN THE PRESS

1. **Nyāyapraveśa** the earliest work on Buddhist logic, by Dinnāga, with commentaries of Haribhadrasūri and Parsvadeva edited by A. B. Dhruva, M. A., LL. B., Pro Vice-Chancellor of the Hindu University, Benares and Pandit Vidhushekhara Bhattacharyya
2. **Sādhnamālā** Vol. II, edited by Benoytosh Bhattacharyya, Ph. D. General Editor, Gaelwad's Oriental Series. Illustrated
3. **Nāṭyasāstra** on dramaturgy, by Bharata with commentary by Abhinavagupta of Kashmir edited by M. Ramakrishna Kavi, Illustrated 4 vols. Vol. I SHORTLY
4. **Kuṇḍarūmakosa** a standard work on Sanskrit Lexicography by Kesava edited by Pandit Ramavatara Sarma Sahityacharya of Patna.

5. **Advayavajrasaṅgraha** consisting of twenty short works on Buddhist philosophy by Advayavajra, a Buddhist savant belonging to the 11th century A. D. edited by Mahāmahopādhyāya Dr. Haraprasad Shastri, M. A., C. I. E. Hon D Litt
6. **Apabhraṃśakāvya-traya** consisting of three works, the Carcarī, Upadesarāsayana and Kālasvarūpikulaka, by Jinadatta Sāri (12th century) with commentaries edited by L. B. Gandhi.
7. **Mānasollāsa** or **Abhilasītārthacintamani**, Vol. II, edited by G. K. Shrigondekar, M. A.
8. **A Descriptive Catalogue of MSS in the Central Library, Baroda Vol II** (Śrauta, Dharma and Grhya Sūtras) compiled by the Library staff
9. **A Descriptive Catalogue of MSS in the Jain Bhandars at Pattan** edited from the notes of the late Mr. C. D. Dalal, by Pandit L. B. Gandhi. 2 vols.
10. **Bhāvaprakāśana** of Saradatanaya an ancient work on Dramaturgy, edited by Pandit Ramaswami Sastry, Central Library, Baroda and His Holiness Yadugiri Yatraja Swami, Melkot.
11. **Prajāñopayavinisāyasiddhi** of Anangavajra and **Jñānasiddhi** of Indrabhūti two important works belonging to the little known Vajrayāna school of Buddhism (8th century A.D.) edited by Benoytosh Bhattacharyya, Ph. D., General Editor, Gaekwad's Oriental Series

* * * * *

The Baroda Library Handbook. By Newton Mohun Dutt, Curator of Libraries, Baroda State. With Introduction by H. E. the Dewan of Baroda. 84 pages royal 8vo 15 illustrations Bibliography 1925 Re. 1-0

For the British provinces and the Indian States where the library movement is in its infancy, or is non-existent, this *Handbook* will be helpful, suggestive and stimulating

—*Bombay Chronicle*, 14. 3. 26